

6.033 System Critique Rubric

| | Advanced | Competent | Developing |
|-------------------|---|---|---|
| Genre | | | |
| Purpose | Introduces system in terms of purpose and response to previous system. Supports with evidence. | States the purpose of the system. | Purpose of system is unclear. |
| System definition | Clearly defines modules and interactions between modules within the system. | May name modules or interactions, but definitions are inadequate and/or relationship is unclear. | System modules are undefined or unidentified. |
| Assessment | Summarizes assessment of system in context of use case(s) and draws conclusions. | Summarizes how properties are prioritized to achieve design goals. | Lacks a full summary of property prioritization. |
| Argument | | | |
| Analysis | Evaluates the system's achievement of purpose and properties, and tradeoffs between properties. Links techniques to properties they improve or degrade. Defines properties in context of use cases or design goals, if necessary. | States whether a property is important to system and supports that importance with evidence from text. Does not relate this to use cases consistently. May not evaluate tradeoffs or may omit link between properties and techniques. | Lacks textual evidence in supporting analysis. Does not explore all properties requested. |
| Scope | Assessment of behavior and properties is justified (1) by the primary use case and (2) by speculative use cases that reveal limits of properties in system. | Behavior and properties are explored exclusively within a single use case. | Behavior and properties are not connected to a use case. |
| Evidence | Analysis is supported by critical engagement with evidence from text. | Evidence from text is used to support analysis, but primarily by restating author assertions rather than critically engaging with their validity. | Minimal or no evidence from text <i>or</i> significant overuse of direct quotation. |

6.033 System Critique Rubric

| Discourse | | | |
|-------------------------------|---|--|--|
| Systems terminology | Precise and field-specific language includes system terminology: properties, behaviors, and use cases. | System-specific terminology is used, but inconsistently or imprecisely. | Language is vague and/or generalized. |
| Sentence structure and syntax | Uses strong subjects and active verbs. Applies known-new structure appropriately. | Uses strong subjects and active verbs. Syntax does not interfere with understanding of content. Information may not be organized effectively. | Syntax is confusing. Sentences lack clear connection to the content. Information is not organized effectively. |
| Audience | | | |
| Audience awareness | Demonstrates an awareness of audience's focus on summary, disagreement, and evaluation. Uses systems concepts and terminology accurately and effectively in evaluation. | May report on the system without evaluation, as though to demonstrate understanding of the paper; or may assume audience knowledge and fail to summarize or define system or key concepts. | Critique is written for a non-technical or otherwise inappropriate audience. |