

The Consortium for Graduate Studies in Gender, Women, Culture and Sexuality
Massachusetts Institute of Technology (WGS 640)
Harvard Divinity School (HDS 1505)
Brandeis University (NEJS 218a 1)

Fall 2016

Contesting Gender and Sexuality, Making Early Christianity

Instructors:

Bernadette J. Brooten, Brandeis University (brooten@brandeis.edu)

Office hours: Before class; many Tuesdays, 2–3, and by appointment in Mandel
Humanities Center 113

Karen L. King, Harvard University (karen_king@harvard.edu)

Office hours: Wed. 4–5 pm and by appointment
in Andover 503

Course Meetings:

Wed., 5–8 p.m.

Harvard Divinity School (45 Francis Ave., Cambridge): room TBD

September 7, 2016–December 7, 2016

Course Description and Learning Goals:

Religion has been and remains a critical site both for constructing and for contesting sex/gender identities, roles, and sexualities. Women's relationship with religion has been particularly fraught. In the ancient Roman world where Christianity was shaped, religion was implicated in every aspect of social life, including law and politics, legal status of slave or free; ethnic identity; family and sexuality; medical and philosophical notions of what it means to be human; the organization of social space; gendered speech and writing; and indeed the very structure of the cosmos. In this context, Christians both contested and reshaped attitudes toward the family and sexuality, redefined ethnicity, and negotiated imperial power, while at the same time appropriating many of the values and assumptions of a highly stratified slave society where public exhibitions of torture were normal and the binary of male/female was structurally foundational.

Learning goals include the following:

- (1) Students will learn how to engage a variety of disciplines, methods, and frameworks for critically engaging constructions and performances of sex/gender/sexuality in early Christian and contemporaneous texts.
- (2) The aim is to promote analytic reading strategies that engage the contested and multi-perspectival character of varied religious materials.
- (3) Students will gain a better understanding how gender and sexuality intersect with religion and other complex categories, including legal status as enslaved, freed, or free; ethnicity; and social and economic location within the highly stratified Roman Empire.

- (4) Students will be able to recognize and assess uses and echoes of these ancient sources in contemporary religious discussions and debates on gender and sexuality.
- (5) The broader goal of the seminar is to foster a lively discussion of both the limits and the possibilities that this material offers for imagining a more expansive sphere for human flourishing today.

Course Requirements:

We will evaluate student performance on the basis of the quality demonstrated in completing the following assignments:

- (1) Active class participation (regular class attendance, preparation of the readings, contribution to class discussions including careful listening and response to others). If a student may not attend class owing to a religious obligation, please contact the instructors at the start of the semester, so that we can make alternative arrangements. In the case of a snowstorm resulting in the cancellation of class, we ask you to be available for an online class discussion, if possible.
- (2) Postings. As one of the requirements for the course, we are asking you to post a reaction to the assigned reading for each week in advance of the class meeting. On the syllabus are a few short sentences that briefly set out the topic for each week and are aimed to help you in thinking about the reading for that week. Your posting should directly engage the reading.

The goal is for you to set aside some time to think and write about what struck you as most interesting or puzzling in the reading around that topic and why, and to communicate some of your ideas and questions to the rest of the group. Your collected postings can serve both as a kind of “diary” or log of your thinking in the course, and as topics for wider class discussion.

No particular form or style is required—the postings are not expected to offer a thesis as a formal paper would. The web postings are subject to the same principles of academic integrity as all other oral and written work. Please do feel free to connect the readings to current topics or issues that you are thinking about more generally. A successful posting will demonstrate knowledge of and thoughtful engagement with the assigned materials. We want to hear your voice and thinking, not just a summary of the reading.

The instructors will not grade or respond in writing to the individual postings as such, but will let you know if they are meeting—or exceeding!—our expectations by midterm. You may request feedback any time about how you are doing.

Each posting should be about 300–500 words in length, and is due by Monday, 5 p.m., on the week the reading is due (i.e., in advance of the class meeting where the material will be discussed). The first posting is due Sept. 12th. Students are required to post **ten times** during the semester. Instructions for how to post weekly responses will be on the course website.

- (3) A final research paper (no more than 4,000 words in length, excluding notes and bibliography) on a topic of your choice in consultation with the instructors. The paper should directly engage at least one ancient Christian writing and discuss the implications of an interdisciplinary examination of one of the course topics. Please follow the style

sheet and sample notes posted on the course website. Due on December 10, 2016, 11:59 p.m. on the course web page.

Final grades will be determined as follows:

- **Class participation: 20%**
- **Web postings: 30%**
- **Final research paper: 50%**

Students with Disabilities:

If you are a student with a documented disability on record at your university and wish to have an accommodation made for you in this class, please notify the instructors within the first week of the course.

Expectations concerning Preparation Time:

Students are expected to spend at least nine hours, on average, in preparation for each three hours in class, including reading, web postings, preparation of presentations, and the research and writing of the final paper.

Policy on Incompletes and Late Papers:

Incompletes will only be granted on the basis of illness, death in the family, or other unavoidable emergency. No late web postings will be accepted. Permission to hand in the research paper late must be obtained from the instructors prior to the due date for the assignment. Late work will normally receive lower grades.

Policy on Academic Integrity and Sexual and/or Racial Harassment:

Academic integrity is central to the mission of education excellence. Students will be held responsible to the policy of their institutions and should consult their institution for rules on academic integrity. Please contact the instructors if you have any questions or doubts about matters such as collaborative work or standards, required practices of citation (esp. in the case of web materials, oral presentations, or paraphrasing).

We understand academic integrity minimally to require: putting in quotation marks all phrases, clauses, and sentences that another person wrote (changing a few words is insufficient to this requirement); giving full citation of any ideas or materials from another author (including when you paraphrase another person's argument or materials) in footnotes or endnotes; and not handing in any part of a paper that you are handing in to another professor for academic credit or for which you have already received academic credit.

The course aspires to a climate of respect and equity for all participants. Both faculty and students will be held responsible to the policies of their institutions on sexual and racial harassment and should consult their institutions for rules and procedures for reporting and preventing such behaviors.

Required Books (need to be available throughout the course):

- Brooten, Bernadette, ed., with the editorial assistance of Jacqueline Hazelton. *Beyond Slavery: Overcoming its Religious and Sexual Legacy*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010.
- Brooten, Bernadette. *Love Between Women: Early Christian Responses to Female Homoeroticism*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1996.
- King, Karen L. *The Gospel of Mary: Jesus and the First Woman Apostle*. Santa Rosa, CA: Polebridge Press, 2003, 141–154.

Recommended Books (for your own library or to consult for own research; these do not necessarily contain required readings):

- Attridge, Harold W. and the Society of Biblical Literature, eds. *The HarperCollins Study Bible*, revised and updated edition. San Francisco: HarperOne, 2006.
- Gaca, Kathy L. *The Making of Fornication. Eros, Ethics, and Political Reform in Greek Philosophy and early Christianity*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2003.
- Glancy, Jennifer A. *Corporal Knowledge: Early Christian Bodies*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2010.
- Harper, Kyle. *From Shame to Sin: The Christian Transformation of Sexual Morality in Late Antiquity*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2013.
- Knust, Jennifer. *Abandoned to Lust: Sexual Slander and Ancient Christianity*. New York: Columbia University Press, 2006.
- Labovitz, Gail. *Marriage and Metaphor: Constructions of Gender in Rabbinic Literature*. New York: Lexington, 2009.
- Meyer, Marvin. Ed. *The Nag Hammadi Scriptures*. New York: HarperOne, 2007.
- Moore, Stephen D. *God's Beauty Parlor and Other Queer Space in and Around the Bible*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2001.

Schedule of Topics and Reading Assignments:

9/7 Introduction to the Course: Frameworks, Questions, Goals

Within the ancient Mediterranean world of the Roman Empire, Christians both contested and reshaped attitudes toward the family and sexuality, redefined ethnicity, and negotiated imperial power, while at the same time appropriating many of the values and assumptions of a highly stratified slave society where exhibitions of torture were part of public, urban life. How might our understanding of these attitudes and practices be inhibited or enhanced by the frameworks within which we study them? What theoretical and methodological tools are most useful? What is at stake and for whom in what questions we ask and which frameworks we employ?

Required Reading:

- **Butler, Judith**. “Torture and the Ethics of Photography.” In *Frames of War. When is Life Grievable?* London and New York: Verso, 2009, 63–100.
- **Crenshaw, Kimberlé**. “Mapping the Margins: Intersectionality, Identity Politics, and Violence Against Women of Color.” *Stanford Law Review* 43 (1991) 1241–1299.
- **Enke, A. Fimm**. “The Education of Little Cis.” In *The Transgender Studies Reader* 2. Ed. Susan Stryker and Aren Z. Aizura. New York and London: Routledge, 2013, 234–247.

9/14 Beyond the Binary: How to Think Historically about Gender Fluidity and Ambiguity in Ancient Mediterranean Societies

Transgender theory and research challenges everyone to think beyond binaries and to create analytical frameworks and social practices equally shaped by persons anywhere on the gender spectrum. Contemporary movements can lead researchers to read ancient texts and artifacts in new ways. Historicizing includes finding terminology suitable to the time period, place, and culture. As researchers of gender fluidity and ambiguity in antiquity, we can enrich contemporary discussions by investigating specific cultural concepts and practices that will denaturalize contemporary concepts of a strict gender binary. The learning goal of this unit is to enable seminar participants to interrogate how we read upcoming texts.

Required Reading:

- Genesis 1
- Diodoros of Sicily 32.10.2–10
- Lucian of Samosata, *Dialogues of the Courtesans* 5; §§289–92
- *Mishnah*, Tractate *Bikkurim* 4.1–3
- *Hippocratic Corpus*, *Peri diatēs* 1.28–29
- Malatino, Hilary. “Pedagogies of Becoming: Trans Inclusivity and the Craft of Being,” *Transgender Studies Quarterly* 2 (2015) 395–410.
- Wenig, Margaret Moers. “Male and Female God Created Them: *Parashat Bereshit* (Genesis 1:1–6:8). In *Torah Queeries: Weekly Commentaries on the Hebrew Bible*. Ed. Greg Drinkwater, Joshua Lesser, and David Shneer. New York: New York University Press, 2009, 11–18.
- Guest, Deryn. “Troubling the Waters: תהום, Transgender, and Reading Genesis Backwards.” In Teresa J. Hornsby and Deryn Guest. *Transgender, Intersex, and Biblical Interpretation*. Atlanta: SBL Press, 2016, 21–44.
- Brooten, *Love Between Women*, 51–57, 162–171, 275–280.
- Fonrobert, Charlotte Elisheva. “Regulating the Human Body: Rabbinic Legal Discourse and the Making of Jewish Gender.” In *Balancing on the Mechitza: Transgender in the Jewish Community*. Ed. Noach Dzmura. Berkeley: North Atlantic, 2010, 167–169.
- Partridge, Cameron Elliott. “Transfiguring Sexual Difference in Maximus the Confessor,” *Harvard Theological Review* 101 (2008), 520 (abstract of dissertation).

Recommended Reading:

- Fonrobert, Charlotte Elisheva. “Regulating the Human Body: Rabbinic Legal Discourse and the Making of Jewish Gender.” In *The Cambridge Companion to the Talmud and Rabbinic Literature*. Ed. Charlotte Elisheva Robert and Martin S. Jaffee. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007, 270–294.

9/21 Ancient Bodies and the Social Life of Gender

One of the insights of early feminism was to see how seemingly objective accounts of human bodies worked to naturalize power relations and justify social structures. Butler, however, points us forward from this insight: It is important not only to understand how the terms of gender are instituted, naturalized, and established as presuppositional but to trace the moments where the binary system of gender is disputed and challenged, where

the coherence of the categories are put into question, and where the very social life of gender turns out to be malleable and transformable.” In this session, we’ll frame our discussion around these insights and ask: How did ancient Mediterranean medical and philosophical literature conceptualize bodies and sexual difference? How were such conceptualizations implicated as Christians promoted certain kinds of Christian social order, ethics, and theology (that is, how is the Christian life and salvation differentiated by sex/gender, age, status)? How are Christians variously assuming, negotiating, resisting or transforming the “sex/gender protocols” of their social and political contexts? For now our example will be the New Testament book, 1 Timothy, but we will return to these questions throughout the course.

Required Reading:

- Butler, Judith. “Introduction: Acting in Concert” and “The Questions of Social Transformation.” In *Undoing Gender*. New York: Routledge, 2004, 1-16, 204–231.
- Dean-Jones, Leslie. “Medicine: The ‘Proof’ of Anatomy.” In *Women in the Classical World: Image and Text*. Ed. Elaine Fantham et al. New York: Oxford University Press, 1994, 183–205.
- *The Infancy Gospel of James* (Available on-line at <http://www.earlychristianwritings.com/text/infancyjames-hock.html>).
- Tertullian, *On the Resurrection* and *On the Flesh of Christ* (selections; handout).
- Glancy, Jennifer A. “Mary in Childbirth.” In *Corporal Knowledge. Early Christian Bodies*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010, 81-140.
- Jordan, Mark D. “God’s Body.” In *Queer Theology: Rethinking the Western Body*. Ed. Gerard Loughlin. Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 2007, 281-292.

Further Reading:

- Aristotle, *Generation of Animals* I.2 (716a–716b); I.17–II.1 (721b–732a); II.3 (737a.18–34); IV.1. Trans. A. L. Peck. Loeb Classical Library. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1942, 10–15; 48–135; 164–177; 370–395; or a different translation is available on-line at <http://archive.org/details/generationofanim00arisoft>.
- Hanson, Ann Ellis. “The Medical Writers’ Woman.” In *Before Sexuality: The Construction of Erotic Experience in the Ancient Greek World*. Ed. David M. Halperin et al. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1990, 309–337.
- Cicero. *Tusculan Disputations* 3–4. In *Cicero on the Emotions: Tusculan Disputations 3 and 4*. Trans. and commentary by Margaret Graver. Chicago: University of Chicago, 2002, (or an alternative translation is available on-line at <http://www.gutenberg.org/ebooks/14988>).
- Nussbaum, Martha. “The Stoics on Extirpation of the Passions.” *Apeiron* 20 (1987) 129–177.

9/28 Erotic Desire and Erotic Celibacy in Relation to Gender

Female homoeroticism and the desire of males to play a passive sexual role drew harsh criticism within the Roman world. How do the following (brief) treatments help you to understand the social order envisioned by these ancient authors? How does gender intersect in these texts with ethnic identity, citizenship, social and economic status, age, and legal status as free or enslaved? How would you compare Thekla’s performance of gender in the *Acts of Thekla* with gender as envisaged in the following ancient texts? Lesbian-feminist theory and queer studies will inform the discussion.

Required Reading:

- Romans 1–3, 7:1–3
- 1 Corinthians 6:9–7:31, 12–14
- 1 Timothy 1:8–11
- Acts of Thekla
- (Jewish philosopher) Philo of Alexandria. *On the Special Laws* 3.37–42
- (Early Christian writer) Clement of Alexandria. *Paidagogos* 3.3
- (Satirist) Lucian. *Dialogues of the Courtesans* 5
- (Astrologer) Dorotheos of Sidon. *Carmen astrologicum* 2.4.21; 2.12–17; 2.26.18. (*Dorothei Sidonii Carmen astrologicum: Interpretationem Arabicam in linguam Anglicam versam una cum Dorothei fragmentis et Graecis et Latinis*. Ed. David Pingree. Leipzig: Teubner, 1976, 48, 53, 76, 202, 206–207, 230)
- Brooten, Bernadette J. *Love Between Women: Early Christian Responses to Female Homoeroticism*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1996, 51–53, 119–123, 239–258, 320–337.
- Moore, Stephen D. “Introduction: The Year of the Queer” and “Sex and the Single Apostle.” In *God’s Beauty Parlor: And Other Queer Spaces in and Around the Bible*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2001, 7–18, 133–172.

Further Reading:

- Brooten, Bernadette J. *Love Between Women: Early Christian Responses to Female Homoeroticism*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1996, 281–294.

10/5 Sexual Difference and its Deployments: Enacting, Negotiating, Resisting

Christians were fully members of the ancient Mediterranean world. They shared the basic assumptions of their time and place about such matters as sexual difference, masculinity and femininity, household order, and much more. As we’ve seen, however, including the inadequacy of elite ideals to contain or determine gendered behaviors—how they can be enacted, negotiated, or resisted. We will return to these topics throughout the course. For today, consider how these “protocols” of masculinity and femininity are operating in 1 Timothy, the story of Susannah and the elders, and the Gospel of Mark.

Required Reading:

- Williams, Craig A. *Roman Homosexuality*. 2nd ed. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010, pp. 3–14, 137–176.
- 1 Timothy
- Glancy, Jennifer A. “Protocols of Masculinity in the Pastoral Epistles.” In *New Testament Masculinities*. Ed. Stephen D. Moore and Janice Cape Anderson. Semeia 45. Atlanta: Society of Biblical Literature, 2003, 235–264.
- Daniel 13 (on Susanna and the elders) ((Available on-line at <https://www.biblegateway.com/passage/?search=Daniel+13&version=DRA>)
- Livy, *History of Rome* 1.58 (on the rape of Lucretia) (Available on-line at <http://www.perseus.tufts.edu/hopper/text?doc=Perseus%3Atext%3A1999.02.0151%3Abook%3D1%3Achapter%3D58.>)
- Hippolytus, *Commentary on Daniel* (fragments “On Susannah”) (Available on-line at [http://www.ccel.org/ccel/schaff/anf05.iii.iv.i.x.vi.html.](http://www.ccel.org/ccel/schaff/anf05.iii.iv.i.x.vi.html))

- Drake, Susanna. *Slandering the Jew: Sexuality and Difference in Early Christian Texts*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2013, 1-17; 99-105.
- Gospel of Mark
- Liew, Tat-siong Benny. “Re-Mark-able Masculinities: Jesus, the Son of Man, and the (Sad) Sum of Manhood?” In *New Testament Masculinities*. Ed. Stephen D. Moore and Janice Cape Anderson. Semeia 45. Atlanta: Society of Biblical Literature, 2003, 93-135.

10/12 Reading Paul: Sex or no Sex?

We are devoting special attention to the apostle Paul’s writings on sexuality, because his discussion of sex workers, of refraining from sex within marriage, of celibacy, and of same-sex sexual expression are foundational for Christian thought and practice. Paul’s earliest students and successors, however, interpreted him in contradictory ways. Some of Paul’s successors took him in a more radically ascetic direction, while others read him as supporting marriage. Each of these views correlated with certain responses to the political structure of society. We will analyze how each of these post-Pauline authors produced plausible readings of Paul, and we will discuss how each of our own understandings of sexuality and of asceticism shapes our reading of Paul and of his successors. For example, do you see Paul’s asceticism as out of sync with the majority cultural values of the twenty-first century? We will use performance theory, the history of philosophy, and feminist and womanist biblical scholarship to help address these questions and to raise others.

Required Reading:

- 1 Corinthians 6:9–7:31; 12–14
- Colossians, esp. 3:18–4:1
- Ephesians, esp. 5:1–6:9
- 1 Timothy
- *Acts of Thekla*
- Aristotle. *Politics* I.3–13 (1253b–1260b). (Available online at <http://www.perseus.tufts.edu/hopper/text?doc=Perseus%3Atext%3A1999.01.0058%3Abook%3D1%3Asection%3D1253b> [English]; <http://www.perseus.tufts.edu/hopper/text?doc=Perseus%3Atext%3A1999.01.0057%3Abook%3D1%3Asection%3D1253b> [Greek].)
- Smith, Mitzi J. “‘This Little Light of Mine’: The Womanist Biblical Scholar as Prophetess, Iconoclast, and Activist.” In *I Found God in Me: A Womanist Biblical Hermeneutics Reader*. Ed. Mitzi J. Smith. Eugene, OR: Wipf and Stock, 2015, 109–129.
- Glancy, Jennifer. “Obstacles to Slaves’ Participation in the Corinthian Church.” *Journal of Biblical Literature* 117 (1998) 481–501.
- MacDonald, Margaret Y. “Beyond Identification of the Topos of Household Management: Reading the Household Codes in Light of Recent Methodologies and Theoretical Perspectives in the Study of the New Testament,” *New Testament Studies* 57 (2011) 84–90, or the whole article: 65–90.
- Bain, Katherine. “Socioeconomic Status in Early Christianity and Thekla’s Rejection of Marriage.” *Journal of Feminist Studies in Religion* 27 (2011) 51–69.

Further Reading:

- Butler, Judith. “The Question of Social Transformation.” *Undoing Gender*. New York: Routledge, 2004, 204–231.
- Junior, Nyasha. *An Introduction to Womanist Biblical Interpretation*. Louisville, KY: Westminster John Knox, 2015.
- Martin, Dale B. “Paul Without Passion: On Paul’s Rejection of Desire in Sex and Marriage” and “Familiar Idolatry and the Christian Case Against Marriage.” In *Sex and the Single Savior: Gender and Sexuality in Biblical Interpretation*. Louisville, KY: Westminster John Knox, 2006, 65–76 and 103–124.

10/19 Contestations over Marriage, Virginity, and Celibacy

As we’ve seen, sexual ethics and sexual practices were contentious matters among early Christians. Various proposals for ideal Christian attitudes and practices were offered, often with reference to reported sayings of Jesus or purported letters of Paul. In this session we will examine a range of early Christian perspectives, and ask about their broader aims, for example, to shape a person morally and spiritually; to prove the superiority of Christian life and practice; or to naturalize and authorize the (sexual) politics of Christian sociality.

Required Reading:

- Martin, Dale B. “Paul Without Passion: On Paul’s Rejection of Desire in Sex and Marriage.” In *Sex and the Single Savior: Gender and Sexuality in Biblical Interpretation*. Louisville, KY: Westminster John Knox, 2006, 65–76.
- Colossians 3:1-2, 5.
- Matthew 19:1–12; 22:23-33
- Acts 2:43–47; 5:1–11
- Plato. *Republic* 5.1–9. In *Plato in Twelve Volumes*. Vol. 5, *The Republic: Books I–V*. Trans. Paul Shorey. Loeb Classical Library rev. ed. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1937, 449–461.
- Clement of Alexandria, *Stromateis* Book 3, esp. 1-2, 5-7, 12-13. In *Clement of Alexandria Stromateis Books One to Three*. Trans. John Ferguson. Fathers of the Church 85. Washington D.C.: Catholic University of America Press, 1991, 256-326; or available on-line at <http://www.earlychristianwritings.com/text/clement-stromata-book3-english.html>.
- 1 Timothy (review)
- Ephesians 5:3-33 (review)
- *The Gospel of Philip*. Trans. M. Scopello in *The Nag Hammadi Scriptures*. Ed. Marvin Meyer. 4th Edition. San Francisco: HarperOne, 2006, 157-186. (Available on-line at <http://referenceworks.brillonline.com.ezp-prod1.hul.harvard.edu/browse/coptic-gnostic-library>.)
- “The Place of the *Gospel of Philip* in the Context of Early Christian Claims about Jesus’s Marital Status.” *New Testament Studies* 59.4 (October, 2013), 565-587.
- *The Testimony of Truth*. (Available on-line at <http://referenceworks.brillonline.com.ezp-prod1.hul.harvard.edu/browse/coptic-gnostic-library>.)
- Soranos. *Gynecology* I.7.30–32 (handout).
- *Acts of Thekla* (review)

- Burrus, Virginia. “Word and Flesh: The Bodies and Sexuality of Ascetic Women in Christian Antiquity.” *Journal of Feminist Studies in Religion* 10 (1994), 27-51.
- John Chrysostom, *On Virginity, Instruction and Refutation directed against those Men Cohabiting with Virgins*, and *On the Necessity of Guarding Virginity* (selections). In *Women in Early Christianity*. Ed. Patricia Cox Miller. Washington D.C.: Catholic University Press of America, 2005, 105-138.

Further Reading:

- Gaca, Kathy L. *The Making of Fornication: Eros, Ethics, and Political Reform in Greek Philosophy and Early Christianity*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2003, 221-305.

10/26 Marriage Law

One can read rabbinical, ecclesiastical, and other jurisprudential discussions, responses, and legal codes and rulings as a way to construct gender and sexuality. Historians of women also ask what effect they may have had on women’s lives. What does the Talmud assume about women’s and men’s respective over-riding concerns with respect to marriage? In which ways do the following Jewish and Christian legal texts treat marriage as a symmetrical relationship and in which ways as an asymmetrical one? How do the Christian texts navigate the tension between a preference for celibacy and an attempt to shape marriage in with Christian ideals (a tension that began with Paul’s earliest followers)? The discussion will be based on the methods of feminist rabbinics and feminist analysis of Christian canon law.

Required Reading:

- Canons of the Synod of Elvira (ca. 306). Laeuchli, Samuel. *Power and Sexuality: The Emergence of Canon Law at the Synod of Elvira*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1972, 126–135
- Canons of the Synod of Gangra (ca. 343)
- Basil of Caesarea. *Letters* 188, 199, 27 (“Canonical Letters”; 374–375). (Available at: <http://people.ucalgary.ca/~vandersp/Courses/texts/cappadoc/basilcep.html>)
- Brooten, Bernadette J. “Bishops versus Radical Ascetics: The Synod of Gangra (343),” Unpublished Manuscript.
- Brooten, Bernadette J. “Enslaved Women in Basil of Caesarea’s Canonical Letters: An Intersectional Analysis,” in *Doing Gender, Doing Religion*. Ed. Ute Eisen, Christine Gerber, and Angela Standhartinger. Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2013, 325–355.
- Labovitz, Gail. “The Purchase of His Money: Slavery and the Ethics of Jewish Marriage.” In *Beyond Slavery: Overcoming its Religious and Sexual Legacy*. Ed. Bernadette J. Brooten, with the editorial assistance of Jacqueline Hazelton. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010, 91–105.
- Watts Belser, Julia. “Brides and Blemishes: Queering Women’s Disability in Rabbinic Marriage Law,” *Journal of the American Academy of Religion* 84 (2016) 401–429.

Further Reading:

- Evans-Grubbs, Judith. “Abduction Marriage in Antiquity: A Law of Constantine (CTh IX. 24. I) and its Social Context,” *Journal of Roman Studies* 79 (1989) 59–83.

- Hauptman, Judith. "Marriage." Chap. 3 in *Rereading the Rabbis: A Woman's Voice*. Boulder, CO: Westview, 1998.
- Labovitz, Gail. *Marriage and Metaphor: Constructions of Gender in Rabbinic Literature*. New York: Lexington, 2009.

11/2 The Sexual Economy of Gendered Slavery

Although slavery was widespread in the Roman world, its significance for early Christian thought and practice has only begun to be analyzed. Enslaved women and girls were treated differently from enslaved men and boys in both law and practice. How do slavery, gender, parenthood and childhood, and marital status inflect one another in the following ancient sources? How do Roman law and early Christian canon law construct gender in relation to enslavement and freedom? The discussion will include intersectionality theory, legal theory and history, and feminist biblical scholarship.

Required Reading:

- Epistle to the Colossians 3:18–4:1
- Epistle to the Ephesians 5:21–6:9
- First Epistle of Peter 2:11–3:7
- Canons of the Synod of Gangra (ca. 343)
- Brooten, Bernadette J. "Introduction." In *Beyond Slavery: Overcoming its Religious and Sexual Legacy*. Ed. Bernadette J. Brooten, with the editorial assistance of Jacqueline Hazelton. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010, 1–29.
- Brooten, Bernadette J. "Early Christian Enslaved Families (first to fourth century)," in *Children and Family in Late Antiquity: Life, Death and Interaction*, ed. Christian Laes, Katariina Mustakallio, and Ville Vuolanto. Leuven: Peeters, 2015, 111–134.
- Harper, Kyle. *Slavery in the Late Roman World, AD 275–425*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011, 291–304.
- Briggs, Sheila. "Gender, Slavery, and Technology: The Shaping of the Early Christian Moral Imagination." In *Beyond Slavery: Overcoming its Religious and Sexual Legacy*. Ed. Bernadette J. Brooten, with the editorial assistance of Jacqueline Hazelton. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010, 159–176.
- Nazer, Mende, with Bernadette J. Brooten. "Epilogue." In *Beyond Slavery: Overcoming its Religious and Sexual Legacy*. Ed. Bernadette J. Brooten, with the editorial assistance of Jacqueline Hazelton. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010, 309–318.

Further Reading:

- Glancy, Jennifer A. "Early Christianity, Slavery, and Women's Bodies." In *Beyond Slavery: Overcoming its Religious and Sexual Legacy*. Ed. Bernadette J. Brooten, with the editorial assistance of Jacqueline Hazelton. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010, 143–158.
- Martine, Clarice J. "The Eyes Have It: Slaves in the Communities of Christ-Believers." In *A People's History of Christianity: Christian Origins*. Ed. Richard A. Horsley. Minneapolis: Fortress, 2005, 232–239 (or whole article: 221–239).
- Exodus 21:1–11; Leviticus 25:35–55 (focus on verses 39–46); Deuteronomy 15:1–18 (focus on verses 12–18). Read two translations of each: Jewish Publication Society and New Revised Standard Version.

- Wright, David P. “‘She Shall Not Go Free As Male Slaves Do’: Developing Views About Slavery and Gender in the Laws of the Hebrew Bible.’ In *Beyond Slavery: Overcoming its Religious and Sexual Legacy*. Ed. Bernadette J. Brooten, with the editorial assistance of Jacqueline Hazelton. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010, 125–142.
- Mishnah, Tractate *Qiddushin* 1:2–3; Tractate *Gittin* 4:5; 7:4. These are in the third order of the Mishnah, which is called *Nashim* (“Women”). The edition by Philip Blackman is useful (BM 506.G53 B6), as is the Kehati edition.
- Try reading the above chapters on the Bible and Ancient Near East and Early Christianity in conjunction with others in *Beyond Slavery*. E.g., the Briggs piece (which deals with the criminalization of enslaved women) goes well with that by Ellen Barry, “From Plantations to Prisons: African American Women Prisoners in the United States,” 75–88: the Glancy chapter (which employs Bordieu’s concept of *habitus*) fits well with Dorothy Roberts, “The Paradox of Silence and Display: Sexual Violation of Enslaved Women and Contemporary Contradictions in Black Female Sexuality,” 41–60, and so forth.

11/9 “In the beginning ...”

One of the most fecund literary texts for Christian thinking about gender, sexual hierarchy, and theology has been the protological narrative of Genesis 1–6. We will examine a selection of both ancient and contemporary interpretations of its story in order to inquire about the discursive frameworks, methods, and practices of scriptural interpretation.

Required Reading:

- King, Karen L. “No Longer Marginalized: From Orthodoxy and Heresy Discourse to Category Critique and Beyond.” In *The Bible and Women. An Encyclopaedia of Exegesis and Cultural History*. Ed. Outi Lehtipuu and Silke Petersen. Forthcoming.
- *Genesis* 1–6
- Vol. “Early Christian Writings.”
- Tribble, Phyllis. “A Love Story Gone Awry.” Pp. 72-143 in *God and the Rhetoric of Sexuality*. Philadelphia: Fortress, 1978.
- *1 Timothy* (esp. 2:8–15)
- Tertullian. *On the Apparel of Women* I.1 (Available online at <http://www.earlychristianwritings.com/text/tertullian27.html>)
- *Hypostasis of the Archons* (also titled *The Reality of the Rulers* and the *Book of Norea*). (Available on-line at www.gnosis.org/naghamm/hypostas.html.)
- King, Karen L. “Ridicule and Rape, Rule and Rebellion: *The Hypostasis of the Archons*.” In *Gnosticism and the Early Christian World*. Ed. James E. Goehring, Charles W. Hedrick, Jack T. Sanders with Hans Dieter Betz. Sonoma, CA: Polebridge Press, 1990, pp. 3-24.
- Knust, Jennifer Wright. “Illicit Sex, Wicked Desire, and the Demonized Heretic.” In *Abandoned to Lust. Sexual Slander and Ancient Christianity*. New York: Columbia University Press, 2006, 143-163, 228-236.

Recommended Reading:

- King, Karen L. *The Secret Revelation of John*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2006, esp. 89–94, 122–156, 225–234.

- King, Karen L. "Reading Sex and Gender in the *Secret Revelation of John*." *The Journal of Early Christian Studies* 19.4 (2011), 519-538.
- Bal, Mieke. "Sexuality, Sin, and Sorrow: The Emergence of the Female Character." In *Women, Gender and Religion: A Reader*. Ed. Elizabeth A. Castelli, with the assistance of Rosamond C. Rodman. New York: Palgrave, 2001, pp. 149-173.

11/16 Martyrs

Christians produced an extensive literature regarding the Roman arrest, torture, and execution of men and women who declared themselves to be Christians. The Roman judicial system regularly used practices of public shaming and torture to propagate their politics and power. Christians' responses required destabilizing gendered discourses of honor/shame and ethical character ("queering vulnerability"). We will explore the logic and limits of their strategies, as well as their (potentially) radical effects, both sociologically and theologically.

Reading:

- *4 Maccabees*
- Moore, Stephen and Janice Capel Anderson. "Taking It Like a Man: Masculinity in 4 Maccabees." *Journal of Biblical Literature* 117 (1998) 249–273.
- *Martyrdom of Perpetua* (Available on-line at <http://www.earlychristianwritings.com/text/tertullian24.html>.)
- Eusebios of Caesarea, *Church History* 5.1: *Martyrs of Lyon*
- Perkins, Judith. *The Suffering Self: Pain and Narrative Representation in Early Christianity*. New York: Routledge, 1995, 104–123.
- *Revelation*
- Moore, Stephen D. "Revolted Revelations." In *God's Beauty Parlor: And Other Queer Spaces in and Around the Bible*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2001, 173-199.
- *1 Apocalypse of James*. (Available on-line at <http://referenceworks.brillonline.com.ezp-prod1.hul.harvard.edu/browse/coptic-gnostic-library>.)
- King, Karen L. "*1 Apocalypse of James* and Valentinians on Martyrdom." In *Valentinianism*. Ed. Christoph Marksches and Einar Thomassen. Leiden: Brill, forthcoming.

Further Reading:

- Shaw, Brent D. "Body/Power/Identity: Passions of the Martyrs." *Journal of Early Christian Studies* 4.3 (1996) 269–312.
- Cobb, L. Stephanie. *Dying to Be Men: Gender and Language in Early Christian Martyr Texts*. New York: Columbia University Press, 2008.

11/23 No Class

11/30 Mary Magdalene

One of the most prominent figures in Christianity is Mary Magdalene. Little is known of her historically, but multifarious representations of her in story and art have left an impact on many women's lives. We will consider how these representations have impacted women's roles as prophets, leaders, ascetics, and (repentant) prostitutes from

the first century to the twenty-first. As you read these selections, consider how representations of Mary Magdalene's gender and sexuality intersect with notions of sin and flesh, purity and impurity, status (class), racial and religious identity.

Required Reading:

- New Testament: Matthew 27:45-28:20; Mark 14:1-11; Luke 7:36-8:3; 23:44-24:12; John 12:1-8; 7:53-8:11; 20:1-18.
- *The Gospel of Mary*
- Gregory of Antioch, *Sermon on the Bearers of Ointment* 6-12; Gregory the Great, *Sermon* 33.1,5; *Sermon* 25. (English translation and commentary in Esther de Boer, *The Mary Magdalene Cover-up. The Sources behind the Myth*. London: T&T Clark, 2007, 156-183.
- *Life of Mary the Harlot* (Available online at <http://www.doaks.org/resources/publications/doaks-online-publications/holy-women-of-byzantium/talbch3.pdf>.)
- McCarthy, Rebecca Lea. *Origins of the Magdalene Laundries: An Analytical History*. Jefferson, NC: McFarland & Company, 2010, 7-14, 135-167.
- King, Karen L. *The Gospel of Mary: Jesus and the First Woman Apostle*. Santa Rosa, CA: Polebridge Press, 2003, 141-154.
- Brock, Ann Graham. *Mary Magdalene, the First Apostle: The Struggle for Authority*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2003, 161-175.
- Schaberg, Jane. "How Mary Magdalene became a Whore." *Bible Review* 8.5 (1992), 30-37, 51-52.
- Setterholm, Mary. "Woman Why are You Weeping? The Prostitutes' Ever-Present Need for a Re-imagined Mary Magdalene." Panel presentation, SBL, November, 2010.

Recommended Reading:

- Harper, Kyle. *From Shame to Sin. The Christian Transformation of Sexual Morality in Late Antiquity*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2013, 218-236.

12/7 I. Clothing, the Passions, Gender, and Legal Status

How did ancient understandings of passion, desire, gender, and legal status shape Christian practices of sexual differentiation and legal stratification? How was clothing "Christianized?" To answer these questions requires drawing upon theories of the body and discourse, as well as anthropological/sociological practice theory.

Required Reading:

- 1 Corinthians 11:2-16
- Tertullian. *On the Veiling of Virgins*. (Available online at <http://www.tertullian.org/anf/anf04/anf04-09.htm>.)
- *Acts of Thekla*
- Canons of the Council of Gangra (ca. 343)
- *Corpus Iuris Civilis: Digesta* (Ulpian, 2nd-3rd C.) 47.10.15.15-27
- Kristi Upson-Saia, Carly Daniel-Hughes, and Alicia J. Batton, eds. *Dressing Judeans and Christians in Antiquity*. Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2014, 175-194.
- Sebesta, Judith Lynn. "Women's Costume and Feminine Civic Morality in Augustan Rome." In *Gender and the Body in the Ancient Mediterranean*. Ed. Maria Wyke. Oxford: Blackwell, 1998, 105-117.

Further Reading:

- Bourdieu, Pierre. “Haute Couture and Haute Culture.” In *Sociology in Question*. London: Sage, 1993, 132–138.
- D’Angelo, Mary Rose. “Veils, Virgins, and the Tongues of Men and Angels: Women’s Heads in Early Christianity.” In *Women, Gender, Religion: A Reader*. Ed. Elizabeth A. Castelli. New York: Palgrave, 2001, 389–419.
- Daniel-Hughes, Carly. *The Salvation of the Flesh in the Carthage of Tertullian: Dressing for the Resurrection*. New York: Palgrave, 2011, 45–62, esp. 53.
- Foucault, Michel. “Technologies of the Self.” In *Essential works of Foucault 1954–1984*. Vol. 1, *Ethics: Subjectivity and Truth*. Ed. Paul Rabinow. New York: New, 1994, 223–251.
- Hoodfar, Homa. “The Veil in Their Minds and on Our Heads: Veiling Practices and Muslim Women.” In *Women, Gender, Religion: A Reader*. Ed. Elizabeth A. Castelli. New York: Palgrave, 2001, 420–446.

II. Concluding Discussion