

CIVIL-MILITARY RELATIONS

MIT, Spring 2003
Political Science 17.584
Wednesdays, 1-3
Room: E51-393

Prof. Roger Petersen
Room E53-487
E-mail: rpeters@mit.edu
Phone: 617-253-6781
Office Hours: Tuesdays from 3:30 to 5:30 or by appointment

Course Overview

The course centers on mechanisms of civilian control of the military. Relying on the influential texts of Lasswell, Huntington, and Finer, the first classes clarify the basic tensions between the military and civilians. A wide-ranging series of case studies follows. These cases are chosen to create a field of variation that includes states with stable civilian rule, states with stable military influence, and states exhibiting fluctuations between military and civilian control. The final three weeks of the course are devoted to the broader relationship between military and society.

Requirements

- A) As the course is a seminar, class attendance and participation are critical.
- B) The major requirement is a comparative research paper (20-30 pages long). In this paper, students must systematically compare civilian control mechanisms (or their absence) across at least two countries. Other projects are subject to approval by the instructor.
- C) Students will also be required to make oral presentations and to write short position papers.

The research paper will account for half of the grade. Class participation and short assignments will each account for a quarter of the grade.

Class Material

- A) A packet of readings is available for purchase.
- B) There are also six required books:
 1. Desch, Michael, *Civilian Control of the Military: The Changing Security Environment* (Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 1999).
 2. Cohen, Eliot, *Supreme Command: Soldiers, Statesmen, and Leadership in Wartime* (New York: The Free Press, 2002).
 3. Feaver, Peter and Richard H. Kohn, *Soldiers and Civilians: The Civil-Military Gap and American National Security* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 2001).
 4. Stepan, Alfred, *Rethinking Military Politics: Brazil and the Southern Cone* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1988).
 5. Hunter, Wendy, *Eroding Military Influence in Brazil: Politicians Against Soldiers* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1997).

6. Katzenstein, Peter, *Cultural Norms and National Security* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1997).

Schedule

February 5: Introductory Class

February 12: General Issues I

A. Desch, Michael, *Civilian Control of the Military: The Changing Security Environment* (Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 1999).

B. Lasswell, Harold, "The Garrison State," *The American Journal of Sociology* 46 (1941): 455-468.

C. Lasswell, Harold, "The Garrison-State Hypothesis Today," in *Changing Patterns of Military Politics*, Samuel Huntington, ed. (New York: The Free Press of Glencoe, 1962), pp. 51-70.

D. Friedburg, Aaron, "Why Didn't the United States Become a Garrison State?" *International Security* 16 (4) (1992): 109-137.

February 19: General Issues II

A. Huntington, Samuel, *The Soldier and the State* (New York: Vintage Books, 1957), Chapters 1-3, pp. 7- 79.

B. Huntington, Samuel, "Reforming Civil-Military Relations," in *Civil-Military Relations and Democracy*, Lary Diamond and Marc Plattner, eds. (Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 1996), pp. 3-11.

C. Finer, S. E. *The Man on Horseback: The Role of the Military in Politics* (Boulder: Westview Press, 1988), Chapter 13, pp. 223-297.

D. Cohen, Eliot, *Supreme Command: Soldiers, Statesmen, and Leadership in Wartime* (New York: The Free Press, 2002). Selected chapters

E. Feaver, Peter, "The Civil-Military Problematique: Huntington, Janowitz, and the Question of Civilian Control," *Armed Forces and Society* 23 (Winter 1996): 149-178.

Cases

February 26: The United States

A. Feaver, Peter and Richard H. Kohn, *Soldiers and Civilians: The Civil-Military Gap and American National Security* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 2001). Introduction, Chapters 1, 2, 5, 8, 13

March 5: The Soviet Union I

A. Kolkowicz, Roman, "Toward a Theory of Civil-Military Relations in Communist (Hegemonial) Systems," in *Soldiers, Peasants, Bureaucrats* (London: Allen and Unwin, 1982), pp. 231-251.

B. Kolkowicz, Roman, *The Soviet Military and the Communist Party* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1967), Chapters 2, 4, 10, pp. 11-35, 81-98, 322-349.

C. Colton, Timothy, *Commissars, Commanders, and Civilian Authority: The Structure of Soviet Military Politics* (Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press, 1981), Chapters 10-12, pp. 221-289.

The Case of the Great Purge

D. Reese, Roger, "The Red Army and the Great Purges," in *Stalinist Terror: New Perspectives*, J. Arch Getty and Roberta T. Manning, ed.

E. Watt, Donald, "Who Plotted Against Whom? Stalin's Purge of the Soviet High Command Revisited," *Soviet Military Studies* 3 (no. 1): 46-65.

F. Main, Steven, "The Red Army and the Soviet Military and Political Leadership in the Late 1920's: The Case of the 'Inner-Army Opposition of 1928,'" *Europe-Asia Studies* 47 (March 1995): 337-355.

March 12: The Soviet Union II--Transition, Attempted Coup, and the post-Soviet Military

A. Meyer, Stephen, "How the Threat (and the coup) Collapsed: The Politicization of the Soviet Military," *International Security* Vol. 16 (3) (Winter 1991/92): pp. 5-38.

B. Holloway, David, "State, Society, and the Military under Gorbachev" *International Security* (Winter 1989/90) 14 (3) (Winter 1989/90): pp. 5-24.

C. Mendeloff, David, "Explaining Russian Military Quiescence: The 'Paradox of Disintegration' and the Myth of a Military Coup," *Communist and Post-Communist Studies* 27 (3)(1994): 225-246.

D. Lepingwell, John, "Soviet Civil-Military Relations and the August Coup," *World Politics* 44 (1992): 539-72.

E. Lepingwell, John, "The Russian Military in the 1990's: Disintegration or Renewal?" in *Russia's Future: Consolidation or Disintegration?* Douglas W. Blum, ed. (Boulder, Co.: Westview Press, 1994).

F. Blank, Stephen, "The Great Exception: Russian Civil-Military Relations," *World Affairs* 165 (2002): 91-105.

March 19: Latin America I

- A. Sigmund, Paul, "Approaches to the Study of the Military in Latin America," *Comparative Politics* 26 (1993): 111-122.
- B. Rouquie, Alain, "Demilitarization and the Institutionalization of Military-dominated Polities in Latin America," in *Transitions from Authoritarian Rule: Prospects for Democracy*, Guillermo O'Donnell, Phillippe C. Schmitter and Lawrence Whitehead, eds., (Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 1986).
- C. Stepan, Alfred, *Rethinking Military Politics: Brazil and the Southern Cone* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1988).
- D. Loveman, Brian and Thomas Davies, Jr., "Instability, Violence, and the Age of the Caudillos", in Loveman, Brian and Thomas Davies, Jr., eds., *The Politics of Anti-Politics: The Military in Latin America* (Wilmington: Scholarly Resources, 1997), pp. 15-28.

March 26: NO CLASS, SPRING BREAK

April 2: Latin America II

- A. Loveman, Brian, "Protected Democracies: Antipolitics and the Political Transitions in Latin America", in Loveman, Brian and Thomas Davies, Jr., eds., *The Politics of Anti-Politics: The Military in Latin America* (Wilmington: Scholarly Resources, 1997), pp. 366-423.
- B. Valenzuela, Samuel, "Democratic Consolidation in Post-Transitional Settings: Notion, Process, and Facilitating Conditions," in Scott Mainwaring et al, *Issues in Democratic Consolidation: The New South American Democracies in Comparative Perspective* (South Bend: University of Notre Dame Press, 1992), pp. 57-104.
- C. Hunter, Wendy, *Eroding Military Influence in Brazil: Politicians Against Soldiers* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1997).

April 9: Turkey and Pakistan

- A. Rustow, Dankwart, "The Army and the Founding of the Turkish Republic," *World Politics* 11 (1959): 511-552.
- B. Rizvi, Hasan-Askari, "The Military and Politics in Pakistan," *Journal of Asian and African Studies* 26 (1991): 27-42.
- C. Heper, Metin, and Aylin Guney, "The Military and Democracy in the Third Turkish Republic," *Armed Forces and Society* 22 (1996): 619-642.
- D. Sakallioğlu, Umit Cizre, "The Anatomy of the Turkish Military's Political Autonomy," *Comparative Politics* (1997):151-166.

E. Cohen, Stephen, *The Pakistan Army* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1984). Chapters Two and Five.

April 16: Japan (Prof. Richard Samuels to lead the class)

A. Katzenstein, Peter, *Cultural Norms and National Security* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1997).

B. Watanabe, Tsuneo, "The Bankruptcy of Civil-Military Relations in Japan," Summer 1996, NIRA Review

C. Berger, Thomas, "From Sword to Chrysanthemum: Japan's Culture of Anti-Militarism," *International Security* 17 (4).

April 23: Africa

A. Jackman, Robert, and Rosemary O'Kane, Thomas Johnson, Pat McGowan, Robert Slater, "Explaining African Coup d'Etat," *American Political Science Review* 80 (1986): 225-250.

B. Other readings to be announced.

April 30: The Military in Multiethnic States

A. Enloe, Cynthia, *Ethnic Soldiers* (Athens, GA: University of Georgia Press, 1980), Chapters 1, 5, 6

B. Horowitz, Donald, *Ethnic Groups in Conflict* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1985), Chapters 11, 12, 13.

C. Petersen, Roger, "The Organization of the Military in Multiethnic States," unpublished manuscript.

D. Peled, Alon, *A Question of Loyalty: Military Manpower Policy in Multiethnic States* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1998), Preface and Chapter 1.

May 7: The Military and Social Change I

A. Janowitz, Morris, *The Reconstruction of Patriotism* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1983) Chapter Three, "Military Service as Civic Education", pp. 43-72.

B. van Doorn, Jacques, *The Soldier and Social Change* (London: Sage Publications, 1975) Chapter 3. "The Decline of the Mass Army, pp. 51-64.

C. Cohen, Eliot, *Citizens and Soldiers: The Dilemmas of Military Service* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1985) Chapters 5-9, pp. 117-189.

May 14: The Military and Social Change II

A. Goldstein, Joshua, *War and Gender: How Gender Shapes the War System and Vice Versa* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001). Introduction, Chapters 1 and 7.

B. Moskos, Charles, and John Allen Williams, David Segal, *The Postmodern Military: Armed Forces after the Cold War* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2000). Chapters 1, 2, 14.

C. Miller, Laura and John Allen Williams, "Do Military Policies on Gender and Sexuality Undermine Combat Effectiveness?" in Peter Feaver and Richard H. Kohn, *Soldiers and Civilians: The Civil-Military Gap and American National Security* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 2001), pp. 361-402.