Recent Studies in Tudor and Stuart Drama

GARRETT A. SULLIVAN JR.

A review of scholarship on Renaissance drama published in the past year indicates that we are in a period of "normal science"—of incremental elaborations upon already existing conceptual models. Historicism still looms large and is folded into work of all kinds, including "presentist" scholarship. Topics such as subjectivity and nationhood, familiar from decades past, continue to fascinate scholars. Perhaps ecocriticism—identified as a growth area in last year's review essay by Lois Potter—comes as close as anything to a newly emergent topic of analysis, although its ascendance does not coincide with obvious methodological innovation. Continuity with the past should not be confused with stagnation, however. This year saw the publication of some wonderfully rich and exciting scholarship. It also confirmed what Emily C. Bartels and Emma Smith pointed out in the 2010 iteration of this essay: scholarship on early modern drama is dominated by the study of Shakespeare; his works are a language that we all speak,

Garrett A. Sullivan Jr. is Professor of English at the Pennsylvania State University. He is the author of *The Drama of Landscape: Land, Property, and Social Relations on the Early Modern Stage* (1998), *Memory and Forgetting in English Renaissance Drama: Shakespeare, Marlowe, Webster* (2005), and *Sleep, Romance and Human Embodiment: Vitality from Spenser to Milton* (2012). He has also edited numerous works, among which are *The Cambridge Companion to English Renaissance Tragedy* (with Emma Smith, 2010), *Environment and Embodiment in Early Modern England* (with Mary Floyd-Wilson, 2007), *Early Modern English Drama: A Critical Companion* (with Patrick Cheney and Andrew Hadfield, 2007), and the *Encyclopedia of English Renaissance Literature* (co-general editor with Alan Stewart, 2012). He has served as coeditor of *Shakespeare Studies*, and has published in journals such as *Studies in Romanticism, ELH*, *Shakespeare Quarterly, Renaissance Drama*, and *Spenser Studies*.

though thankfully in multiple critical dialects. However, one of 2012's most compelling works of criticism focuses on Thomas Middleton; I take it up at the end of this essay, as the exception that proves the rule.

Classifications are odorous. I have arranged 2012's works (as well as a few strays from preceding years) in categories that individual books often smudge, and which are inadequate to the interpretive riches these books contain. Nevertheless, these categories do provide a blurry snapshot of some major topics of critical investigation.

ECOCRITICISM, HUMANNESS, AND THE NATURAL WORLD

The essays in The Indistinct Human in Renaissance Literature, edited by Jean E. Feerick and Vin Nardizzi, demonstrate that humanness is a matter not of ontological essence but of performance, and the "potential for human indistinction"-for man to blur into "lesser" forms of life—"is the dark underside of Renaissance celebrations of man's preeminent place within the cosmos" (p. 2). While animals have a role to play in this collection—Laurie Shannon convincingly demonstrates that "animals represented no single, philosophically invested category in early modernity" (p. 22), while Steve Mentz argues that the dolphin "figured the limits and hopes of human abilities to live in oceanic space" (p. 29)—most of The Indistinct Human is given over to plants and stones, wooden matter and politic worms. Marjorie Swann discusses how seventeenth-century botanists and poets. who wrongly believed plants to reproduce asexually, "yearned to model human existence on the nonsexual otherness of plants" (p. 141). Nardizzi meditates upon the uncertainty of reference in the character name of Stump in the anonymous A Larum for London; his broader point is that "at root, both wood and the body were understood to consist of the same 'matter' and to be indistinct" (p. 125). Ian MacInnes considers Hamlet in light of the fascinating coincidence of generation and corruption in early modern thinking about invertebrates. Feerick focuses on "garden plots and earthly imagery" (p. 236) in historical tragedies by Thomas Kyd and Shakespeare, arguing that the decaying bodies of the lowborn emblematize "the fundamental indistinction between their flesh and dirt" as well as between "their flesh and that of their social betters" (p. 247). This is a splendid collection filled with exciting work, including additional fine essays by Jay Zysk,

Miranda Wilson, Erin Ellerbeck, Dan Brayton, Hillary M. Nunn, Tiffany Jo Werth, and Jennifer Waldron.

In Shakespeare's Ocean: An Ecocritical Exploration, Brayton offers a critique of ecocriticism's terrestrial bias while also building the case that Shakespeare "everywhere evinces an awareness of an ontological connection between humanity and the ocean" (p. 197). Perhaps unsurprisingly, The Tempest looms large; Brayton discusses it in detail in two chapters, one that considers Caliban as "defined by an ontolological hybridity whose condition of possibility is the sea" (p. 58) and another that centers upon links between Prospero's authority and both navigation and cartography: "Prospero enforces his own geographical hegemony over his political opponents by a stagecraft that is a form of navigation, intervening in the nautical journey of the Neapolitan and Milanese heads of state in a spectacular attempt to reclaim political power" (p. 178). In the main, though, Brayton proceeds thematically, offering commentary on a range of plays (and an occasional poem). For example, Brayton examines tidal metaphors in Shakespeare, arguing for a "tropological evocation of a deep bond between human beings and the physical environment, both driven by the same hydraulic forces" (p. 87). Another chapter centers upon the "special kinship between whales and humans" (p. 108), with a particular emphasis on connections in Shakespeare between princes and whales, "which are emblematic of immense power and of sovereignty, of grandeur and huge appetites" (p. 109). Other topics include the importance of sea voyages to "the figurative construction of ... an 'oceanic subjectivity' throughout Shakespeare's dramatic corpus" (p. 63); and "a cultural poetics of fish ... that link[s] human ontology—desire, hunger, mortality, and the fact of embodiment—with the bodies of marine animals gathered from the depths of the global ocean and sold in the street" (p. 137). Shakespeare's Ocean is elegantly written and successfully fulfills its simultaneously presentist and historicist objectives.

Amy L. Tigner focuses on both literary and actual gardens during an era "in which England moves from being an insular, inward looking country that imagined itself as an enclosed paradise to becoming an imperial state that looked outward for paradise in the New World, importing the flora of paradise to re-create Eden at home" (p. 1). Literature and the Renaissance Garden from Elizabeth I to Charles II: England's Paradise takes the reader from Spenser to Milton; for students of the drama, Tigner's two Shakespeare chapters will be of greatest interest. The first focuses on the figure of the untended garden in Richard

II, Hamlet, and King Lear in order to argue that "failure on the part of the royal house precipitates the decline of the land, the people, and the state into both a metaphorical and actual garden of weeds—in essence, an anti-paradise" (p. 65). The second takes up The Winter's Tale and The Tempest, making the provocative claim that both reference mechanical marvels that populated sixteenth- and seventeenth-century estate gardens. Thus, Hermione's apparent transformation from statue to animate creature evokes the operations of hydraulically powered statues in Italian Renaissance gardens, while Prospero's magic is situated in relation to "courtly garden festivals that included water and fire" (p. 141). Tigner's larger point is that both plays imagine "a world in which mechanical knowledge will enable control over the natural elements and transplanting of its flora for the express purpose of recreating paradise on the island called England" (p. 157). (Tigner repeatedly refers to England as an island—a common geographic error likely bred of John of Gaunt's mythopoetic paean to the "sceptred isle.") Literature and the Renaissance Garden from Elizabeth I to Charles II makes a distinguished contribution to a historicist ecocriticism.

Simon C. Estok's Ecocriticism and Shakespeare: Reading Ecophobia develops connections among ecocriticism and feminism, postcolonial studies, and queer theory. At the heart of Estok's analysis is the concept of "ecophobia": "a pathological aversion toward nature, an aggravated form of anthropocentrism expressed variously as fear of, hatred of, or hostility toward nature at least in part motivated by a sense of nature's imagined unpredictability" (p. 128). Estok discusses King Lear in terms of the titular character's "powerless[ness] within his own kingdom, victimized by the weather, unhoused, and alienated" (p. 19), and he coordinates this powerlessness to a threat to Lear's masculinity. In The Winter's Tale, Estok suggests, "the environment is a vicious space of bears and wolves, or else a beautiful place of fertility and abundance; [similarly,] women are liars, shrews, and lechers all, or else they are chaste, guiltless, or otherwise guileless. There is no ambiguity in the play" (p. 93). But the lack of ambiguity can seem more Estok's than Shakespeare's; he is drawn to firm pronouncements often at odds with most readers' experience of the plays: "Othello is not properly human [because he is not] culturally acceptable. For one thing, he is black, and for another, Desdemona is not" (p. 70); in 2 Henry IV, "the old king is real sickness, but Falstaff is clearly metaphorical sickness, the greatest parasitic infection that threatens the young king" (p. 62). Additionally, while Estok repeatedly champions the merits of his approach—"Doing ecocriticism with Shakespeare extends huge amounts of foundational work ... into exciting new areas, helping us to understand where we have come from, where we are, and where we might be going" (p. 17); "Ecocriticism embraces possibilities. It is committed to diversity and to innovation, to imagining possibilities, and to hope" (p. 124); "Doing ecocriticism means being attentive, alert, and alive" (p. 120)—his central conclusions about the vexed relationship of early modern humans to the natural world are often familiar ones.

POLITICS, NATION, SOVEREIGNTY

Jonathan Baldo's Memory in Shakespeare's Histories: Stages of Forgetting in Early Modern England argues that Shakespeare's second tetralogy investigates the roles that memory and forgetting play in the constitution of the English nation. As a result of the Reformation, England's relationship to its own past was radically altered, and memory emerged as a site of cultural contestation. At the same time, both memory and forgetting functioned as crucial preconditions for fashioning a Protestant nation. Baldo reads Richard II as "enact[ing] a birth of historical consciousness" that "originate[s] in traumatic loss" (p. 11); the monarch is transformed from a being indifferent to the past to one who, like Elizabethans contemplating pre-Reformation history, feels severed from it after his deposition. Baldo's discussion of 1 Henry IV centers upon Sir John Oldcastle's dramatic transformation into Falstaff, which he reads as "largely consistent with Shakespeare's treatment of history in the second tetralogy: specifically, with the ways in which the operations of various kinds of forgetting—rewriting, distraction, erasure—are inevitably implicated in historical memory" (p. 53). Baldo imaginatively connects 2 Henry IV's comparative forgettability to its enactment of "a heterogenous set of memories that resist digestion to a unified historical narrative of the kind that Henry V will attempt to command" in the final play of the Henriad (p. 73). As for Henry V, it demonstrates "that power can usually get away with forgetting a great deal, suppressing any public memory that might challenge it, so long as it wears the cloak of remembrance, as Henry does throughout the play" (p. 103). Even so, Baldo shows *Henry V* to be haunted by that which public memory cannot entirely assimilate—most notably, Oldcastle/Falstaff. The book concludes with a coda devoted to King John, which anticipates the contention of the second tetralogy, that "acts of oblivion are the foundation of national unity, which is built on the quicksands of forgetfulness as well as the rock of remembrance" (p. 149). *Memory in Shakespeare's Histories* is consistently engaging, its interest residing not only in its central argument but also in the author's numerous keen insights into these plays: "2 *Henry IV* takes place in a hollow of history, a time predominantly of recollection and anticipation" (p. 74); or "For Falstaff, the past tense is an invitation to play" (p. 52).

In Europe's Languages on England's Stages, 1590-1620, Marianne Montgomery considers non-English languages as markers not of ineradicable alterity but of cross-cultural exchange. She attends to language's aural dimension, as when she argues that the Welsh of Mortimer's wife in 1 Henry IV "is treated by the text not as signifying language, but as a sound effect" (p. 25). Her broader argument about Shakespeare's second tetralogy is that Welsh and French, both associated with the origins of the Tudor dynasty, intimate the non-identicality of the English language and English national identity. The Dutch of Thomas Dekker's The Shoemaker's Holiday, John Marston's The Dutch Courtesan, and Middleton's No Wit, No Help Like a Woman's registers "the pressures of commerce on emerging ideas of English identity" (p. 50). More specifically, Dutch in these three works offers "a way of thinking about commercial identity ... defined not by bonds of kinship, geography, or monarchy, but by trade and occupation" (p. 18). Spanish is the means by which the monstrous hybridity of Iberian national identity as it appears in the Black Legend is rendered legible. "[The Spanish Tragedy's] Hieronimo ... becomes a recognizable and comprehensible theatrical sign," his status as "the overdetermined type of the Spaniard" confirmed by the fact that both "his costume and his Spanish" reappear in Ben Jonson's The Alchemist (p. 88). Finally, Montgomery takes up Latin as both the idiom of the schools and as a marker of social difference. In Shakespeare's Merry Wives of Windsor and Middleton's A Chaste Maid in Cheapside, "[t]he sound of Latin, both how it is pronounced and how it is heard, ultimately defines and reinforces social boundaries [between characters] ... even as it complicates and temporarily elides social boundaries dividing playgoers" (p. 106). Montgomery's book offers a sustained argument for the theatrical representation of linguistic difference as the vehicle for exploring possibilities for cultural translation.

Jenny C. Mann considers the influence of English vernacular rhetorical handbooks on Renaissance literature, with particular emphasis upon the cultural anxieties and imaginative opportunities engendered by the nationalist project of translating the classical art of rhetoric into English. Outlaw Rhetoric: Figuring Vernacular Eloquence in Shakespeare's England is organized around specific "outlandish figures of speech, disorderly forms" (p. 25) that pose difficulties of or in translation. At the same time, Mann is attuned to the generative possibilities of acts of translation, and she argues that "the inability of English to approximate classical eloquence produces neither silence nor ineloquence, but storytelling" (p. 3). Mann's central literary texts include Sir Philip Sidney's Arcadia, Margaret Cavendish's The Blazing World, and book 6 of Spenser's Faerie Queene; she also takes up Shakespeare's A Midsummer Night's Dream and Jonson's Epicoene. Mann discusses Shakespeare's play in relation to the rhetorical figure of *hypallage*. which "allows one word or phrase to take the place of another in a sentence, just as a changeling takes the place of a human baby" (p. 119). If the comparison to a changeling seems fanciful, the fancy, which is George Puttenham's, attests to a persistent pattern in vernacular rhetoric handbooks: the association of translated figures of speech with ambivalent aspects of English native traditions. A Midsummer Night's Dream finally "produce[s] a visible performance of vernacular culture united by the content of fairy lore and ancient tradition, a fantasy apprehended through the disfigured rhetoric of an English weaver" (p. 143). Mann coordinates Epicoene to ennalage, the "figure of exchange," which troubles vernacular definition because of profound linguistic difference: whereas an inflected language such as Spanish (or Latin) gives us both "el perro" and "la perra," English provides us only with "the dog," the gender of which is indeterminate. Consequently, "enallage reveals a gender problem endemic to English rhetoric [e.g., is the dog male or female?], highlighting the debased status of the vernacular vis-à-vis Latin" (p. 150). However, Epicoene's Dauphine, by changing the "case" (clothes, gender, grammatical form) of the young boy he enlists to play the title character, "uses the grammatical resources and promiscuous appeal of the Latin enallage to compose a proper English inheritance" (p. 168). Mann's study is intelligent, wide-ranging, and elegantly written; it makes a fine contribution to scholarship on early modern rhetoric and English nationalism.

Although Tim Prentki's *The Fool in European Theatre: Stages of Folly* spans the period from *Mankind* and mystery cycles to Bertolt Brecht and Dario Fo, almost half of the book is concerned with Renaissance drama, especially Shakespeare. Prentki offers a study of the fool in his many guises—from trickster figure to court jester—and across many discourses—from Platonic philosophy

to Pauline doctrine. For Prentki, the fool's actions are neither intrinsically conservative nor radical, precisely because the fool mocks all social forms and practices. Crucially, the fool's activity has an affinity with theatrical representation. Falstaff appears in Prentki's analysis as Bolingbroke's shadow, a figure whose actions and utterances "almost expose fatally the sham at the heart of the display of regal power" (p. 53). Similarly, Shakespeare's comic fools reveal the tensions between the "ideal and the real of human nature" (p. 71). Prentki also considers how the relationship between king and fool undergoes modifications in Hamlet, King Lear, and The Tempest: in his madness Hamlet "tried to play the fool not instead of but within the role of the revenger" (p. 104), while "Caliban, like Lear, has experienced the transition from King to Fool and both have had to find a new language in which to record their novel sensations" (p. 117). With Adam Overdo in Bartholomew Fair, Jonson both exploits and deviates from the representational logic of folly: "The essential quality of the fool is to be no one and therefore, possibly, everyone but Overdo is always, obsessively, himself" (p. 123). Filled with sharp insights, Prentki's book is hampered by an overly schematic, almost allegorical approach to its topic and characters (e.g., "Puck is the floating essence of irrationality and arbitrariness and Bottom is the embodiment of earth-bound, plodding logic" [p. 78]). The book is admirable in its scope, but the portion devoted to early modern materials is under-researched and relies on scholarship that is often decades old.

Chris McMahon's Family and the State in Early Modern Revenge Drama: Economies of Vengeance centers upon the way in which revenge plays "privatize" the family by changing the way in which it is valued vis-à-vis the state. The plays that McMahon examines—Kyd's The Spanish Tragedy, Hamlet, Middleton's The Revenger's Tragedy, Marston's The Malcontent, and John Webster's The Duchess of Malfi—coordinate with a specific historical trajectory: "[T]aken all together, these plays tend to move from the aggressive privatisation of the family, through contestation of state authority, towards the elaboration of the private household as an informal state apparatus ... [A]s a sequence, the plays ... can be taken as heuristic (their arrangement tracing the process whereby the private family becomes an organ of an emerging leviathan, the modern nation state)" (p. 6). In developing this narrative, McMahon sometimes treats plays as if they are or should be position papers. For example, The Revenger's Tragedy "makes no significant attempt ... to consider how the state might

be structurally reformed" (p. 106)—but why should it? The marriage of Webster's duchess to Antonio "represent[s] an innovation in government ... Webster's Duchess has incorporated, at the level of her principality, 'protobourgeois' strategies of household management" (p. 155). More explicitly, "The Duchess ... chooses a husband for his merits (which are markedly those of an honest superintendent of household government): a man of ignoble birth who espouses a meritocratic theory of government" (p. 8). Such a view underestimates the extent to which the Duchess's choice of Antonio is informed by her desire and her willful resistance to her brothers' unreasonable edicts; it sacrifices her character to "an innovation in government." McMahon compellingly argues that "the achievement of revenge plays is to give the private family a symbolic weight to rival king and state" (p. 43), but he is less successful when treating literary texts in an overly schematic fashion.

In The Face of Mammon: The Matter of Money in English Renaissance Literature, David Landreth offers a theoretically and historically rigorous account of the place of money—specifically, coins—in late Elizabethan literature and culture. Landreth considers the coin in terms of its intrinsic and extrinsic value. the amount of silver it contains, and the image of the monarch stamped upon its surface. The debasement of the currency under Henry VIII, Mary I, and Edward VI put pressure on the authority of the monarch, insofar as it was royal fiscal policy that led to the adulteration of money. Moreover, the debasement of currency was felt by commonwealth reformers to have moral and ethical dimensions, as it constituted an example of avarice at the expense of the common good. Money's moralized dimensions, as well as its implication in broader questions of value and its own complex ontological status, rendered it an object of fascination for poets. To demonstrate this, Landreth takes up works by Spenser, John Donne, and Thomas Nashe, as well as Christopher Marlowe's The Jew of Malta (read in conjunction with books 2 and 5 of The Faerie Queene) and Shakespeare's King John, Measure for Measure, and The Merchant of Venice. Landreth reads Barabas in his opening soliloguy as "appear[ing] to succeed entirely in accounting for himself as a concatenation of material value"; after his wealth has been confiscated, it functions for Barabas as "a remembered personal completion, a nostalgia for a wholeness of self" (p. 80). King John and Measure for Measure are treated together as plays that take up "the circulation and the manufacture of coinage ... in terms of the reproduction of the sovereign: in the biological production of heirs, in King John, and in the deputizing of officers, in *Measure for Measure*" (p. 49). Landreth's analysis of *Merchant of Venice* centers upon the play's disavowal of that which lies at its core: "The characters of *Merchant* talk about money all the time, and yet they do so in order to claim that what they are really talking about is something incommensurable to money" (p. 150). Out of this disavowal—a counterwish to the truth recognized by all the play's characters—comes "the commonality of interest that defines the social totality as 'commonwealth'" (p. 183). *The Matter of Money* is brilliant, wide-ranging, difficult, and sometimes exhilarating; it is a book that makes a major contribution to recent scholarship on economy and material culture.

In contradistinction to the idea that representation undermines (sovereign and theatrical) authority by revealing its fundamentally illusory nature, Holger Schott Syme's Theatre and Testimony in Shakespeare's England: A Culture of Mediation demonstrates that the authority of early modern cultural performance is constituted out of deferrals and mediations as well as the interplay of absence and presence. For example, the queen's authority is both embodied and made "virtually present" when royal proclamations are read aloud in the marketplace by someone licensed to do so. In the case of the theater, Syme refuses the familiar opposition between stage and page. Instead, he argues for the mutually authorizing relationship of playscript and actor, word and voice. Syme contends that early modern audiences remained aware that the words a player uttered were not his own; the theater "always operated partly in the realm of the virtual, was never fully authentic" (p. 9). At the same time, this virtuality was part of "a system of deferral capable of producing a sense of the real through a perpetual, non-hierarchical collusion between presentation and representation" (pp. 151-2). Syme's first three chapters center on courtroom practice. The second half of his study is given over to imaginative readings of Jonson and Shakespeare. Syme argues that Richard II "lay[s] claim to the kind of eyewitnessing ... central to the evidentiary apparatus of early modern historiography" while also "produc[ing] the effect of its sources, like Chancery clerks or witnesses to spoken words" (p. 201). He contends that The Winter's Tale "continually privileges mediation over immediate experience" (p. 209)—for example, the scroll of Apollo's oracle over Leontes' flawed judgment—in a way that sheds new light on the scene in which Leontes and Perdita's reunion is verbally depicted. Briefer discussions of plays such as Twelfth Night and Much Ado about Nothing are consistently illuminating, even thrilling. This fascinating book will be of great interest to all students of early modern English drama.

GENDER, SEXUALITY, EMBODIMENT

Lynn Enterline's Shakespeare's Schoolroom: Rhetoric, Discipline, Emotion combines a psychoanalytic hermeneutic with archival research into humanist grammar schools in order to demonstrate the theatrical and affective legacies of pedagogical practice in Shakespeare's poetry and prose. While the stated mission of humanist education was to fashion gentlemen through rhetorical training, Enterline demonstrates that pedagogical practice inculcated in students a "habit of alterity," meaning both "a general disposition toward impersonation" and "a highly mediated relation to emotion, a tendency to experience what passes for deep feeling precisely by taking a detour through the passions of others (particularly those classical figures offered as examples for imitation)" (p. 25). Moreover, this habit of alterity engendered in students such as Shakespeare an identification with precisely those figures—women, "barbarians," and those of humble rank—that the school curriculum marginalizes or denigrates. Enterline gives us a Shakespeare who repeatedly returns to scenes of instruction, paying particular attention to the complex interplay of eroticism, punishment ("the master's birch"), and gender- and subject-formation. For example, Enterline considers "loving mastery" in Venus and Adonis, comparing Venus to Ovid's "obtuse 'teacher' ... refus[ing] to acknowledge the reality of her situation while eagerly dispensing erotic advice" (p. 63). Even here there is a link to drama, as Ovidian epvllia reveal the transvestite theater to be "the logical extension of school training in how to become a Latin-speaking gentleman" (p. 88). Enterline also takes up the connection between seduction and education in Taming of the Shrew, arguing that Shakespeare "mocks school habits while once again forcing us directly to confront the erotics of early modern pedagogical practice" (p. 99), which are evoked not only in Bianca's lessons but also in the "taming" of both Sly and Katharina. Enterline next examines "three portraits in grief: Lucrece, Hamlet, and Mamillius" to show that "the technique and possible effects of imitating someone else's passion ... allows [sic] [Shakespeare] to produce the effect of inwardness, of intense personal feeling, long recognized as characteristic of his texts" (p. 122). Moreover, "'woe' connects characters without regard to the reductive gender divide that the schools were carefully designed to institute" (p. 136). This splendid study offers a bracing corrective to analyses that emphasize the humanist schoolroom as little more than a site of social indoctrination.

Central to the argument of James M. Bromley's Intimacy and Sexuality in the Age of Shakespeare are two broad conceptions of intimacy: one predicated upon both interiority and futurity, and enshrined especially in companionate marriage; and one predicated upon proximity and superficiality, in the sense of bodily surfaces rather than psychic depths. Bromley suggests that what to many contemporary readers look like failures of intimacy instead constituted alternative versions of it; "the boundaries of intimacy were fluid and negotiated, only eventually condensing into modern intimacy, itself subject to contestation" (p. 7). For example, Bromley discusses how All's Well that Ends Well and Cymbeline "predicate their male characters' compliance with marriage upon the repudiation of the anus as a site of receptive pleasure" (p. 49). Francis Beaumont and John Fletcher's Philaster and The Maid's Tragedy and (especially) Middleton's The Nice Valour consider the pleasures of masochistic eroticism, while intimacy among cloistered nuns is the focus of a chapter on Robert Greene's Friar Bacon and Friar Bungay, Shakespeare's Measure for Measure, and the anonymous Merry Devil of Edmonton. (Other chapters take up Marlowe's Hero and Leander and Lady Mary Wroth's Urania, respectively.) Bromley's expansion of the terms of intimacy is welcome and important, and his arguments are generally convincing, although he occasionally overreaches. For instance, the claim that Measure for Measure's Isabella seeks same-sex erotic affiliation depends upon an imagined offstage discussion of specific convent rules (p. 139). Nevertheless, Bromley's broader point—that Isabella can be seen as "wishing for restraint for its own pleasures, rather than out of revulsion at other kinds of erotic experience" (pp. 138-9)—offers a valuable alternative to traditional discussions of Isabella's sexuality and exemplifies the strengths of this engaging study.

Duncan Salkeld's *Shakespeare among the Courtesans: Prostitution, Literature, and Drama, 1500–1650* centers upon the relationship between the dramatic representation of prostitution and social history. Salkeld contests accounts of early modern prostitution that emphasize female social and sexual agency; as he puts it, "prostitution was an unpromising career choice in the early modern era, and there is no optimistic story to tell of these women's lives" (p. 20). After a useful introduction on (among other things) the courtesan in classical drama, Salkeld turns to sixteenth-century works ranging from the Digby mystery play of *St. Mary Magdalane* to *2 Henry IV*, with particular attention paid to the "foul disease" trope. Here as elsewhere, Salkeld draws con-

nections with those whose lives appear fleetingly in institutional records, such as Elizabeth Hoer, who was "whipped and then sent to St. Thomas's 'to be cured of the fowle disease'" of syphilis (p. 41). A subsequent chapter offers a sobering discussion of Pericles as a text that "uniquely acknowledges the emerging sexual value of children in a world of commodity and capital" (p. 67). Through the figure of Bel-imperia, Salkeld argues, Kyd's Spanish Tragedy "transformed the Italian courtesan into a figure of striking dignity and strength of character," while Marlowe's Jew of Malta followed "the pattern established by [Pietro] Aretino and Nashe" in depicting Bellamira as "a Machiavellian schemer" (p. 97). The final chapter centers on the figure of the courtesan-turned-wife in comedies by Dekker, Marston, Shakespeare, and Middleton. While these plays find a social place for the courtesan, Salkeld suggests harsher realities remained intractable. Salkeld's comparative approach—he regularly references materials focused on Italian courtesans—is sometimes illuminating, sometimes distracting, with references to Venice or Rome occasionally feeling obligatory. Still, this is a well-researched, lucidly written, and compelling book.

Stanley Wells succinctly states the central claim of Shakespeare, Sex, and Love as follows: "[Shakespeare] knew of the dangers of mistaking animal desire for a higher passion, that the sexual instinct is one that may be misused, that it can lead to rape and murder, to a prostitution of all that is best in man. But he knew too that sex is an essential component of even the highest forms of human love, that it can lead to a sublime realization of the self in a near-mystical union of personalities" (p. 250). The book is divided into two parts. Part 1 features chapters on early modern ideas about sexuality; sex as a topic of poetry, with a particular emphasis on male homoeroticism; and on what "we know, or [might] legitimately infer, about Shakespeare's own knowledge and experience of sex" (p. 68). Part 2 surveys Shakespeare's works from the perspective of specific topics such as "The Fun of Sex," "Sexual Desire," "Sexual Jealousy," and "Whores and Saints." Because of its historical and iconic status, Romeo and Juliet understandably gets a chapter of its own. Wells is an admirably insightful critic, and Shakespeare, Sex, and Love is filled with lucid observations about both the plays and the culture from out of which they emerged. Moreover, he rightly differentiates his approach from that of scholarly revelers in bawdy quibbles, for whom a cigar is never simply a cigar (in this regard, the current book builds upon Wells's earlier Looking for Sex in Shakespeare). For all its undeniable wit and learning, this is a book more likely

to please a general reader than most students of early modern sexuality, partly because sex is subordinated to an idealizing account of "the highest forms of human love," and partly because Wells leaves largely uninterrogated the anachronistic categories of "homosexual," "heterosexual," and "bisexual."

Richard Strier's The Unrepentant Renaissance: From Petrarch to Shakespeare to Milton contests what he deems the gloominess of recent scholarship and models "affirmative rather than undermining reading[s]" (p. 9) of literary works. Strier's aim is to recuperate what he sees as basic elements of lived human experience that have been problematized or rendered anxious by recent criticism, especially new historicism and what he terms "the new humoralism." In a chapter that focuses upon the limitations of reason's rule and the "validity and even the desirability of ordinary human emotions and passions" (p. 42), Strier suggests that The Comedy of Errors expresses skepticism about reason while celebrating feeling; he also reads *King Lear* as "commit[ting] itself to anger" (p. 50), noting that the spokespersons for patience and rational selfregulation are the villains of the piece. Another chapter focuses on Shakespeare's "sense of the limitation of the moral perspective" (p. 99). It develops the argument that Shakespeare did not fully recover from Hal's banishment of Falstaff, an act for which the author "never forgave himself" (p. 107). Strier reads Antony and Cleopatra as "[Shakespeare's] final refutation of the claims of the moral perspective [that led Henry V to banish Falstaff] to ubiquitous priority and relevance" (p. 110). Strier's book is peppered with such insights into Shakespeare, sonnets as well as plays (in addition to the works mentioned above, *Macbeth* and Richard III come in for extended attention).

AESTHETICS AND GENRE

In Reverberating Song in Shakespeare and Milton: Language, Memory, and Musical Representation, Erin Minear argues that "There is ... an insistently sonic aspect to Shakespearean memory. Words recall other words that sound similar, despite differences in meaning—a process at the very root of punning and wordplay—and the characters' imaginary minds are frequently disturbed by snatches of familiar songs" (p. 10). Moreover, she identifies in Shakespeare tensions between "theoretical" and "practical" conceptions of music: the former underwrite commonplace, if embattled, notions of cosmic order ("the music of the spheres"), while the latter inform period suspicions about music's destruc-

tive potential through, say, stirring the passions. In Othello, "all audible music may be nothing but a satiric terrestrial echo of the everlasting harmony of angels: heaven mocking itself" (p. 57). Merchant of Venice provides evidence of music's paradoxical association both with "distracting surfaces and with inward truth, with the body and with the soul (and, indeed, with the uncertain interface between the two)" (p. 38). Similarly, Hamlet offers "extensive and searching treatment of the ability of song to suggest an inward self both integral and hollow, and the possibility of an otherworldly presence lingering in audible sounds" (p. 15), while the capacity of music, even at its most artfully inauthentic, to engender a powerful affective response is considered in Twelfth Night and The Tempest. The book's final chapters focus on Milton, with one devoted to the poet's apprehension of Shakespeare: "Milton finds haunted paradises in the two Shakespeare plays that most haunt his own work: A Midsummer Night's Dream and The Tempest. He comes to view them as plays haunted by paradise, by musical echoes of harmony lingering in a fallen world" (p. 195).

At the heart of Genevieve Guenther's Magical Imaginations: Instrumental Aesthetics in the English Renaissance is the insight that Renaissance writers "were either feeling or exploiting a considerable anxiety that the magician's methods all too closely resembled those of the poet who attempted to use the beauty of language to produce ideological effects" (p. 4). In addition to works by Sidney and Spenser, Guenther takes up Marlowe's Dr. Faustus and Shakespeare's The Tempest. She understands Marlowe's play as drawing audiences to the theater by exploiting the connection between magic and "instrumental aesthetics," the literary production of pleasure in the service of ethical and social aims. Guenther situates Faustus in relation to reformed conceptions of conjuration, which emphasize both that practice's theatricality and its noncompulsory force (demons did not appear at the behest of the conjuror, but because of his "inward alienation from the spirit of God" [p. 67]). Her contention is that Marlowe "produce[s] an aesthetic instrumentality, in which onstage performativity—the staging of conjuration—generated effects that offstage conjuration quite obviously could not" (pp. 64-5). Guenther's reading of The Tempest similarly stresses the peculiar efficacy of the theater: in this play, "Shakespeare demonstrated that his theatre was an utterly autonomous space in which the laws of the realm ... were suspended in favour of the laws of make-believe" (p. 106). The law of the realm most at issue was an act against conjuration instituted by James I that "made all magical practices capital

crimes" (p. 93). Guenther develops the implications of James both witnessing and applauding *The Tempest*, with its magician protagonist, in Court performances; she concludes that the efficacy of Shakespeare's play, in temporarily suspending the act against conjuration, "at once relied on and produced the supreme cultural value of poetry" (p. 106). *Magical Imaginations* is a perceptive study which demonstrates that "in the instrumental aesthetics of the English Renaissance, the charm and the poem had yet to be entirely distinguished" (p. 16).

Adam Max Cohen was a young scholar who completed a short monograph shortly before dying of a brain tumor; Wonder in Shakespeare contains that monograph as well as brief essays by other scholars. Cohen seeks to demonstrate that "the pursuit of the wondrous served as an overarching aesthetic for Shakespeare" (p. 7). He develops a range of ideas about Shakespeare and wonder, such as the connections between the effects of Shakespearean stage wonders and religious awe, the recurring representation of "pseudoresurrection in order to generate a unique and powerful type of wonder" (p. 20), the metaphorical uses of the prodigious birth tradition, and the conceptual links between the theater and cabinets of curiosities ("Shakespeare's performed spectacles satisfied the appetite for wonder that had been fulfilled by the church and were during Shakespeare's career increasingly satisfied by wonder cabinets on the continent" [p. 92]). Cohen's ideas are extended further in six essays that conclude the volume. For instance, Maura Tarnoff develops Cohen's reading of Pericles to show how "the revivals of Thaisa and Pericles highlight the ecological and technological contexts of embodiment" (p. 132). M. G. Aune reads The Merchant of Venice as a "comedy about a sympathetic character's rescue from a potentially fatal situation through a near-miraculous intervention" (p. 150). And Janna Segal builds upon Cohen's claim that Shakespearean wonder owes a debt to medieval drama by discussing Romeo and Juliet in light of the resurrections staged in the Wakefield cycle. Wonder in Shakespeare includes additional essays by Rebecca Steinberger, Kristin Keating and Bryan Reynolds, and Joshua B. Fisher. It also features a moving introduction, written by Cohen in the wake of surgery that extended his life, which discusses how his experience with cancer deepened his relationship to Shakespeare.

In Shakespeare, "Othello" and Domestic Tragedy, Sean Benson suggests that critics have failed to recognize that Othello is "the pre-eminent example" of domestic tragedy and that it "anticipat[es] a democratization in the representation of tragic subjects that

came to fruition only in the twentieth century" (p. 5). Benson rightly argues against a conception of genre as a "static norm" (p. 28) in favor of a view that leaves room for experimentation and change over time. However, in insisting upon Othello's status as a domestic tragedy, rather than a play that appropriates or experiments with elements of that subgenre, he engages in the kind of rigid classification he elsewhere decries. Moreover, this particular act of classification produces difficulties. To make Othello the "pre-eminent example" of domestic tragedy, Benson has to argue against the definitional significance of one of the subgenre's most distinctive features, its emphasis on household life in English towns and villages. Had Benson limited himself to developing the undeniable connections between Othello and domestic tragedies of the period, with an emphasis on the way that Shakespeare's play appropriates, modifies, and interrogates elements of this fascinating subgenre, his interesting study would have been more convincing.

The Last Plantagenet Consorts: Gender, Genre, and Historiography, 1440-1627 focuses upon the representation of fifteenthcentury queens (and, occasionally, nonroyal women such as Jane Shore) in a range of historical writings. Kavita Mudan Finn takes up works such as Polydore Vergil's Anglica Historia, Sir Thomas More's History of King Richard the Third, Edward Hall's Union, Raphael Holinshed's Chronicles and A Mirror for Magistrates, and poetry by Michael Drayton and Samuel Daniel. In chapter 5, Finn discusses three dramatic works from the 1580s and 1590s: Thomas Legge's Richardus Tertius, a Latin tragedy of Senecan influence; the anonymous True Tragedy of Richard III; and Thomas Heywood's two-part Edward IV. While the first of these three plays focuses on major historical figures, the next two broaden the frame to accommodate "colorful characters affected by and participating in [Richard's] usurpation" (p. 127), with Heywood's Edward IV being largely given over to Matthew and Jane Shore. Chapter 6 is devoted to Shakespeare's first tetralogy, the three-part Henry VI and Richard III. Finn considers "how generic shifts and moments of historical subversion cluster around Shakespeare's depiction of queens" (p. 146). She pays particular attention to Margaret of Anjou, who moves in the tetralogy "from courtly lover to adulterous queen to performative king, and, finally, to Sybilline prophetess in Richard III" (p. 148). Finn offers a lucid account, informed by close attention to both gender and genre, of the ways in which the Wars of the Roses' powerful women entered into the early modern imagination.

Kevin A. Quarmby's The Disguised Ruler in Shakespeare and His Contemporaries offers a convincing rejoinder to a new historicist orthodoxy: that the beginning of James I's reign witnessed the emergence and brief flowering of a distinctly Jacobean subgenre, the disguised ruler play. Quarmby's aim is to "resituat[e] the motif [of the disguised ruler] in the early modern canon as a whole" while emphasizing "the disguised ruler's constantly evolving dramatic status within the playhouse repertories" (p. 20). Quarmby begins with history plays from the 1580s and 1590s "that dramatize kings and princes disguising themselves for personal or political ends," including Greene's Friar Bacon and Friar Bungay and Shakespeare's Henry V (p. 25). He examines the convention, derived from medieval chronicles, of the ruler who dresses in fool's motley and encounters Robin Hood. Quarmby next considers The Malcontent, or, as he puts it, The Malcontents a first, late Elizabethan version of Marston's play as produced by the Children of the Chapel and a second version, added to by Webster for the King's Men, that contains anti-Court satire. Quarmby situates Shakespeare's Measure for Measure in terms of the "comical history" tradition of disguised rulers, centered upon secret amatory adventures, in order to show how the Duke meaningfully diverges from that type. Quarmby also makes the intriguing case for Jonson's Bartholomew Fair as a disguised ruler play, and in an afterword he attests to the continued vitality of the figure of the disguised ruler through a discussion of *The Wasp*, a "joyous pastiche" which exists only in manuscript and dates from the late 1630s (p. 221). Other plays granted sustained attention are Middleton's The Phoenix, Marston's The Fawn, Beaumont and Fletcher's The Woman Hater, and Edward Sharpham's The Fleer. Quarmby's study demonstrates that "throughout this period, the disguised ruler in a friar's habit, a fool's motley, a Lincoln-green outlaw's costume or a gentleman's borrowed garments, was never far from the public's imagination, or from the playhouse stages" (p. 222).

Shakespeare and Genre: From Early Modern Inheritances to Postmodern Legacies, edited by Anthony R. Guneratne, considers Shakespeare's works in relation to both early modern and contemporary genres, with genre sometimes expansively construed. The book's first part focuses on Renaissance genres. David Bevington considers how Shakespeare synthesizes and adapts the works of others in his romantic comedies and histories. Lawrence Danson argues that "virtually all of Shakespeare's plays are woven with the mingled yarn of romance, or tragicomedy; the mixed mode

is the Shakespearean default mode" (p. 102). David Crystal advances the notion of metalanguage—language that describes the nature of language—as a genre, with Shakespeare appearing as "the first real metalinguist" (p. 37). The second part centers upon contemporary genres. Alexander C. Y. Huang fascinatingly discusses "the coexistence and confluence of multiple Chinese and diasporic genres to form the polygeneric Shakespeare at the margins" (p. 158). Samuel Crowl considers Kenneth Branagh's indebtedness to established film genres, noticing, for example, how his film version of *Much Ado about Nothing* draws upon both screwball comedies of the 1930s and "the Chiantishire idvll, where a group of otherwise repressed Brits or Americans lose their inhibitions ... under the spell of the Tuscan sun" (p. 196). Tony Howard examines Shakespeare on television as "a self-contained genre in itself, an exceptional, even alien, form of one-off, highart enterprise," albeit one transformed by the video revolution (p. 207), while Peter S. Donaldson's focus is films that engage in a sustained way with "media history, transitions from one medium to another, or media systems and regimes" (p. 223). Part 3 takes up Shakespeare as a genre, with Charles Martindale construing certain plays (Measure for Measure, Troilus and Cressida) that represent "philosophical ideas in action among a group of characters" (p. 242), and Douglas M. Lanier advocating "a pedagogical practice that seeks out the differences between Shakespearean media and genres and those of contemporaneity ... with the intent of getting a critical purchase on both" (p. 269). This strong collection also features new essays by Stephen J. Lynch, Alexander Shurbanov and Boika Sokolova, and Diana E. Henderson, and reprinted work by Stephen Greenblatt and Andrew Gurr.

PHILOSOPHY AND THEORY

In Forgiving the Gift: The Philosophy of Generosity in Shake-speare and Marlowe, Sean Lawrence critiques the work of Marcel Mauss, who conceptualizes the gift as an expression of self-interest because it is given in expectation of getting something in return. The gift is not an isolated act of benevolence, then, but instead forms the basis for models of exchange, negotiation, and circulation; generosity for Mauss is "a ruse of economics, a polite fiction driven by self-interest, or an instrument of social organization" (p. 39). In opposition to this view (which Mauss himself qualifies at times), Lawrence follows Emmanuel Levinas in focusing upon a radical generosity advanced outside of exchange, without

expectation of reciprocity. As Lawrence demonstrates in a lucid prologue focused upon Marlowe's Dr. Faustus, the paradigmatic Protestant example of the Levinasian gift is divine grace, which Faustus refuses in favor of exchange: "Salvation ... requires a violation of the [diabolic] pact, the legitimacy of which Faustus never seriously questions" (p. xx). Lawrence sees Shakespeare and Marlowe as "question[ing] an absolute belief in exchange" (p. 38). Lawrence understands Prospero's return to Milan not as a return to political authority, but as a parent sacrificing himself on behalf of his child. He offers a similarly counterintuitive reading of Edward II: "The love of Edward and Gaveston ... proves recalcitrant to political relations because it violates the self-interest that is assumed to constitute the horizon of both friendship and eroticism" (p. 127). Merchant of Venice—the subject of three chapters—"illustrates the cost of a model of social life in which love becomes competition and mercy is traded for money" (p. 41). Lawrence also considers the tragic consequences of denying the gift in King Lear as well as the claim that the mutilated, mute Lavinia makes on Lucius, Marcus, and Titus in Titus Andronicus. Forgiving the Gift is a clearly written and illuminating account of the ethics of Shakespearean and Marlovian drama.

David Lucking's Making Sense in Shakespeare argues for Shakespeare's skeptical interrogation of notions of causation; as he puts it, in Shakespeare "the process of making sense quite often amounts to ... fabricating meanings that have no necessary or indissoluble relation to the phenomena they purport to be accounting for" (p. 2). This process of fabrication extends to the narratives Shakespeare generates; those his characters engender in order to impart meaning to their lives; and those that readers and playgoers produce about characters and their motives. As Lucking sees it, Shakespeare invites such acts of readerly production even as he demonstrates their limitations. Lucking takes the title of Much Ado about Nothing seriously, arguing that it is "a play 'about' what it means to be about anything. It is a play about the interpretation of events, about the difficulty of correlating sign and signification, about the pitfalls inherent in the construction of meaning" (p. 63). The recurrence of the word "cause" in *Henry V* coordinates with the uncertainty of Henry's motives in waging war against France. More broadly, the play demonstrates a "conception of history as an infinitely complex process little amenable to unitary explanations of any kind, and least of all to explanations in terms of the reasons that human beings adduce for their actions" (p. 109). (Near the end of the

book, Lucking suggests the applicability of the "butterfly effect" associated with chaos theory to Shakespeare's emphasis on the "unknowable or indefinable cause" [p. 199].) Lucking's analysis centers upon plays written around the turn of the seventeenth century, with attention paid not only to *Much Ado* and *Henry V*, but also to *Titus Andronicus*, *Julius Caesar*, and *Hamlet*.

In Retheorizing Shakespeare through Presentist Readings, James O'Rourke argues that historicist scholarship is flawed in its emphasis on early modern culture as irrefutably other, a view that renders Shakespeare's seeming modernity anachronistic. Instead, he argues for a Shakespeare who is "not simply ... a site of cultural complexity but [also] an active cultural interrogator in his own right" (p. 8). Via Jacques Derrida's analysis of J. L. Austin's speech-act theory, O'Rourke champions "a truly performative account of intentionality, one that recognizes that the same words can sustain a multiplicity of illocutionary and perlocutionary logics" (p. 18). Such an account allows for a Shakespeare who both adopts a critical relation to his own period and answers clearly to present-day concerns. O'Rourke's Shakespeare operates in Brechtian terms, denaturalizing the beliefs of his own culture as well as of ours. For instance, the plots of Taming of the Shrew, As You Like It, and Twelfth Night undermine comedy's "generic promise, that it is possible to imagine a world in which the happiest people somehow deserve their good fortune" (p. 37). In *Merchant* of Venice, that Shakespeare "ask[s] an English audience to accept Italian Catholics as representative Christians puts the word 'Christian' into quotation marks and gives the term a critical force that makes it possible, in Brecht's terms, to 'alienate the familiar'" (p. 63). King Lear is skeptical of Protestant revisions of the ars moriendi tradition that discourage grief on the grounds that the deceased is now with God. O'Rourke's study is sprinkled with sharp insights into Shakespeare criticism (e.g., "realist studies describe the Lear universe as a relatively malleable world, where tragedy might be averted if parents and children could learn to communicate more honestly and openly with each other" [p. 139]). Moreover, his discussion of intentionality and his critique of historicism are instructive, even if he is not entirely fair to historicist scholarship, which has long argued for Shakespeare's critical interrogation of his own culture.

Patricia Canning's *Style in the Renaissance: Language and Ideology in Early Modern England* centers on idolatry and iconoclasm in works by George Herbert, Richard Crashaw, Shakespeare, and Middleton and William Rowley. Canning's approach

is informed by stylistics and cognitive theory; her aim is to consider how the conceptual effects of idolatry and iconoclasm are registered at the level of language, while paying particular attention to the ideological nature of linguistic formulations. In a chapter on *Macbeth*, Canning focuses on the question of agency. She observes the regicide's habitual tendency to displace his own murderous deeds, or the desire to commit them, onto the operations of "body parts or his imaginings," thereby turning the murder into "an agent-less crime" (p. 104). Canning's broader point is that "how we linguistically structure the representation of experience offers insights into how we conceive of those experiences socially, ideologically, and so on" (p. 56). The agency of objects—specifically, of body parts—is the topic of a chapter on The Changeling that also develops further Canning's analysis of Macbeth. Canning sees the prominence of parts in Middleton and Rowley's play as reworking the relationship of subject to object, and of part to whole, in a fashion commensurate with Reformation obsession with idolatry. While Canning admirably engages with literary criticism throughout Style in the Renaissance, many of her conclusions about Renaissance drama are not unfamiliar: this book is most likely to find an appreciative audience among students of stylistics.

RELIGION

R. M. Christofides ranges from medieval Doom paintings to recent films in order to demonstrate Western culture's abiding fascination with the prospect of its own demise. At the heart of Shakespeare and the Apocalypse: Visions of Doom from Early Modern Tragedy to Popular Culture, however, are four plays: Hamlet, Othello, Macbeth, and King Lear. Each of these draws upon pre-Reformation apocalyptic imagery to tantalize the reader with a promised end that is never realized. A similar promise is extended by language, which gestures toward a "final, conclusive meaning" (p. 14) that remains always just out of reach. Consequently, Christofides suggests, equivocation is the fundamental condition of language, and Shakespeare's four tragedies "unleash the dark, anarchic side of linguistic heterogeneity when the holy Logos, the transcendental signified," is withheld (p. 6). Christofides reads the graveyard scene in *Hamlet*, which evokes the rising of the dead in Doom paintings, as "allegoriz[ing] the Apocalypse, mediating the audience's encounter with the final Judgment of God" (p. 19). In the wake of murdering Desdemona, Othello desires a "wrathful

Judgement [that] does not arrive" (p. 67). The Doom that never materializes in *Macbeth* informs not only the equivocal prophecies of the witches but also the play's interrogation of masculinity. *King Lear* "substitutes the whip-wielding devils, trumpet-tongued angels and fire-breathing hell-mouths of [Doom paintings] for an alternative image of horror, a slain Cordelia lying limp in Lear's dying embrace" (p. 151). Like the other plays, *Lear* "invokes but withholds the Doom, a traumatic reconciliation between heaven and earth" (p. 182).

Shakespeare, the Bible, and the Form of the Book: Contested Scriptures, edited by Travis DeCook and Alan Galey, seeks to "historicizeel the two monumental traditions of Shakespeare and the Bible and understan[d] their cultural formation in terms of the history of the book" (p. 2). These "two monumental traditions" have tended to treat both Shakespeare and the Bible as stable, even timeless. In contrast, this volume focuses on the heterogeneity and historical contingency of both Shakespearean and biblical texts. For example, Randall Martin demonstrates that while Shakespeareans have tended to treat biblical texts as "semantically stable," "scriptural scholarship ... has always been a controversial practice related to changing social and political contexts" (p. 72). Barbara Mowat examines how Shakespearean biblical allusions reveal his indebtedness to the Geneva Bible while also depending crucially upon "the availability of the Bible in English in a format designed for individual and domestic reading" (p. 36). Andrew Murphy takes up three nineteenth-century English readers from impoverished backgrounds who "arrive at Shakespeare—and make sense of him when they got there—because of their experience of reading (and memorizing) the sacred text." For these and many other readers, "the two texts entered into a kind of compact, intertwining as 'the roots of civilisation'" (p. 139). And David Coleman considers the ways in which the rhetoric of the Ulster Protestant Ian Paisley "combines a Scriptural and Shakespearean hermeneutic" (p. 179) while "attempt[ing] to enlist Shakespeare to an anti-Catholic British identity" (p. 190). Other essays focus upon topics such as biblical referencing in Richard II (Scott Schofield), the ways in which "material inscriptions become transcendental scripture in iconic scenes of writing in Hamlet, Exodus" and on the iPad (Galey, p. 77), and the emergence in the Victorian period of "a veritable subgenre of commonplace book aimed specifically at celebrating the ways that Shakespeare and the Bible speak to one another" (Charles LaPorte, p. 145). This

collection also boasts an excellent introduction and additional fine essays by DeCook, Paul Werstine, and Edward Pechter.

Gary Waller examines how "English writers from the later Middle Ages to the mid seventeenth century both venerated and denigrated [the] body" of the Virgin (p. 27). The Virgin Mary in Late Medieval and Early Modern English Literature and Popular Culture is divided into two major sections, with the destruction of representations of Mary in 1538 serving as a watershed. The first section examines the role of the Virgin in late medieval literature and culture. The second, "post-1538" section considers the post-Reformation legacy of both Mary and anti-Marian iconoclasm, which, as Waller demonstrates, was consistently interwoven with (often virulent) misogyny. Of most interest to readers of this essay will be Waller's chapter on "Shakespeare and the Virgin," which takes up All's Well that Ends Well, Pericles, and The Winter's Tale. Waller suggests that Helena's appearance at the end of All's Well evokes the Mariological tradition of the Pregnant Virgin, while Pericles features "a series of journeys by its hero, who in effect acts out a spectrum of views of pilgrimage," with each journey "ha[ving] at its end a female figure, placed there either as a known goal or by an ambiguous force which can be labeled providence, coincidence, fate or just chance" (pp. 166-7). As for Winter's Tale, "The return, revival, or resurrection of Hermione ... reaches back to the complex and overlapping traditions of the Virgin as the source of miracles" (p. 178). Waller's book is animated by a presentist perspective and is at times unabashedly speculative. However, as his speculations are usually both credible and compelling, they constitute one of the book's numerous virtues.

CLASS, CARNIVAL, SOCIAL CONFLICT

In Carnival and Literature in Early Modern England, Jennifer C. Vaught argues that the "rituals, customs, and habits associated with annual, seasonal holidays can be appropriated for most any cause or agenda—preservative and normative or revisionary and transgressive" (p. 7). Moreover, these social practices are not "owned" by a particular social group, but can instead be deployed in any milieu: "A Lord of Misrule could be an aristocrat, gentleman, or servant who acted as master during the topsy-turvy, Christmas and New Year celebrations by wearing a crown, giving toasts, and leading the drinking" (p. 9). Vaught also locates traces of festive practice in some surprising places. For example, she connects book 1 of Spenser's Faerie Queene to the Mummers' Play St. George

and the Fiery Dragon. Less surprisingly, drama looms large in this analysis. In her discussion of Doctor Faustus (which is examined alongside Jew of Malta and Merchant of Venice), Vaught illuminatingly coordinates the play with motifs and figures of carnival, such as "saucy servants and tricksters; parodies of religious or other sacred or secular authority figures; grotesque processions and magical spectacles; and a cannibalistic feast" (p. 23). In this case, festive traditions operate in the service of Marlowe's republican sympathies. On the other hand, carnivalesque elements of Dekker's The Shoemaker's Holiday (discussed alongside Twelfth Night, The Winter's Tale and Bartholomew Fair) "demarcate a fluid, social hierarchy and emerging market economy and exhibit ambivalence toward republican notions of liberty for aspiring merchants, artisans, and laborers" (p. 91). Vaught does a fine job of demonstrating the influence of festive practice on some of the most canonical works of English Renaissance literature; her book will be of keen interest to students of early modern popular culture.

Jennifer Feather's Writing Combat and the Self in Early Modern English Literature: The Pen and the Sword centers upon two conflicting models of combat: a "premodern" model that "sees combat as mutually constitutive of both combatants" and a "modern" (or humanist) model that "sees combat as an agonistic struggle in which the victor gains agency at the expense of objectifying the vanguished" (p. 1). The book's first chapter begins with a fascinating discussion of the way in which Renaissance anatomists appropriate the discourse of combat in order to distinguish their activities from those of grave robbers or corpse violators. From there, Feather turns to Titus Andronicus and Julius Caesar to argue that these plays articulate a notion of Roman virtue commensurate with the "modern" model while also revealing an "alternative vision [i.e., the "premodern" model] of both body and agency that relies ... on a set of relationships formed through combat and the wounds it produces" (p. 75). Chapter 2 shows how the representation of female suicide in *Antony and Cleopatra* and The Rape of Lucrece, as well as the story of Voadicia in Holinshed, is both informed by period conceptions of combat and linked to issues of national identity. In *Antony and Cleopatra*, the Egyptian queen's suicide is crucial to the formation of imperial identity, while Lucrece's suicide suggests that "fortitude is productive of social cohesion and autonomy" in the form of the Roman Republic (p. 113). Writing Combat also includes chapters on Sir Thomas Malory's Morte D'Arthur and book 5 of Spenser's Faerie Queene. It is a fine book on an interesting topic.

Elizabeth Rivlin's The Aesthetics of Service in Early Modern England considers the representational effects of changes in the economics of service on both prose fictions—Nashe's The Unfortunate Traveller and Thomas Deloney's The Gentle Craft-and plays—Shakespeare's The Comedy of Errors, The Two Gentlemen of Verona, The Winter's Tale, and The Tempest; Jonson's The Alchemist; and Dekker's The Shoemaker's Holiday. Rivlin contends that the gradual transition from residual feudal conceptions of service to emergent capitalist ones opened up new subjective possibilities that she describes in terms of aesthetic service. Aesthetic service has a performative dimension: it is constructed out of "facilities" such as "adaptability, skill in impersonation, and explicitly artistic abilities" (p. 16). Crucially, aesthetic service encompasses central activities of the theater—the businesses of playing and writing. Rivlin's approach sheds interesting light on Jonson's "internal debate over authorial self-possession and dispossession," arguing that he was "not striving to break free from service as much as he was grappling with its changing meanings for his authorial identity, textual form, and public reception" (p. 109). Similarly, Rivlin coordinates Shakespeare's theatrical "apprenticeship," represented by his early comedies, to the depiction of playerservants who "begin to author themselves and their masters" by "skillfully misperform[ing] their masters' commands, [thereby also functioning as exemplars whom their masters imitate" (p. 27). Rivlin's discussion of *The Shoemaker's Holiday* encompasses not only Lacy, "a prototype for the aesthetic servant" (p. 96), but also Ralph, who cannot master protocapitalist service's performative dimension. Her study nicely concludes with the interplay of mastery and servitude in The Tempest's epilogue, and with the resonant insight that "the absence of service would have been a dystopian, not a utopian, premise for early modern drama and prose fiction" (p. 164).

Peter J. Smith's *Between Two Stools: Scatology and Its Representations in English Literature, Chaucer to Swift* begins by contrasting two engravings by Martin Droeshout: one, a satirical image of bodily purgation conducted by the (Rabelaisianallynamed) Dr. Panurgus; the other, the famous likeness of the author that graces Shakespeare's First Folio. Smith juxtaposes these images to suggest the anachronistic nature of their seeming incongruence. His broader aim is to demonstrate that a "carnivalesque, merry, even hearty disposition" toward scatology, apparent in Chaucer and Shakespeare, coexisted until late in the seventeenth century with the more censorious attitude,

marked by self-disgust, "misanthropy and hypochondria," that would eventually come to dominance (p. 6). Early modern drama is represented in two Shakespeare chapters. The first focuses on "onomastic scatology," arguing that the "carefully chosen names of Shakespeare's characters, phallic, fecal and flatulent, may provide a crucial clue to the way in which the [name's] bearer should be perceived" (pp. 92-3). Smith develops intriguing connections between As You Like It's Jaques and the "jakes" (or pit toilet) punningly associated with the title of Sir John Harington's satirical pamphlet Metamorphosis of Ajax. The second chapter centers upon the puzzle Twelfth Night's Malvolio encounters in Maria's "M. O. A. I" riddle, suggesting it evokes the title of Harington's pamphlet as well as the "comedy of metamorphosis itself" (p. 121). Were they to make the connection to Harington, early modern theatergoers would recognize the "comic effect of the fastidious Malvolio alluding to a text that is ... scatological and shameless in the extreme" (p. 125). In sum, Smith presents us with a Shakespeare who, like Droeshout, combines high and low, "run[ning] canonical and carnivalesque together" (p. 6).

Chris Fitter's Radical Shakespeare: Politics and Stagecraft in the Early Career finds evidence of the playwright's populism in 2 Henry VI, As You Like It, The Taming of the Shrew, and Romeo and Juliet. In a well-researched introduction, Fitter discusses both the crisis years of the 1590s and a Tudor tradition of radicalism rooted in, among other things, commonwealth reform, church teachings, resistance theory, and republicanism. Turning to the plays, Fitter first links the Jack Cade uprising to a rebellion led by William Hacket to suggest "a surprisingly substantial sympathy for underclass sufferings and popular rebellion" in 2 Henry VI (p. 47); instead of a demonized Cade, Fitter gives us a figure identified with the carnivalesque Lord of Misrule. (Here as elsewhere, Fitter is attentive to performance traditions and theatrical practice as well as social history, arguing that Shakespeare's radicalism becomes most legible on stage.) Fitter situates Romeo and Juliet in relation to "conditions in London between 1594-96—the escalating inter-class youth violence, the dearth of 1594-97, and the sensational London riots of 1595" (p. 145); the play demonstrates a "sustained populist sensitization to social inequity" (p. 166). Similarly, As You Like It, "with its cast of malnourished cottager, bankrupt gentleman, starving vagrants, scathing malcontent, and assorted political refugees, takes pains to foreground anti-Arcadian perspectives, evoke political ills, and countervaluate harsh contemporary attitudes" (p. 175). While Fitter's argument

is not always convincing—his dismissal of orthodox aspects of Shakespeare's works as the playwright's effort to evade censor-ship does not ring true—*Radical Shakespeare* offers an important perspective on Shakespearean drama of the 1590s.

Maria Teresa Micaela Prendergast argues for railing as an Elizabethan and Jacobean literary subgenre associated primarily with printed plays and pamphlets. In Railing, Reviling, and Invective in English Literary Culture, 1588–1617: The Anti-Poetics of Theater and Print, Prendergast examines texts associated with the Martin Marprelate pamphlet war, the Nashe-Harvey debate, the Poetomachia, and the querelle des femmes spawned by the Joseph Swetnam controversy and revived by, among others, Constantia Munda, Jane Anger, and Jane Sharp. To Prendergast, railing texts articulate their own "anti-aesthetic," while the practice of railing constructs a male homosocial community of writers that is agonistic in nature (although, in the case of the Poetomachia, poets later turned from feuding to dramatic collaboration). Two of the book's chapters center upon drama. The first takes up plays of the Poets' War (including Marston's Histrio-mastix, Dekker's Satiromastix, and especially Jonson's Every Man Out of His Humour), as well as Shakespeare's Troilus and Cressida. Whereas Jonson, Dekker, and Marston offer "defensive attacks against antitheatrical pamphlets," Troilus and Cressida "stages a caustic critique of the self-destructive results of railers' aggressive rhetorical posturings" (p. 46). Prendergast also considers how Coriolanus and Timon of Athens relocate railing from the "envious educated man" to "the angry aristocrat" (p. 145). Unlike earlier railing texts, these two plays do not articulate "an alternative aesthetics at the margins of literary culture" (p. 147). Prendergast's approach to railing productively brings into conversation a range of texts usually considered independently of one another. There are some infelicities—the long introduction cries out for streamlining, and Prendergast's frequent allusions to the emergence of print in the late sixteenth century are puzzling. Nevertheless, this is a lucidly argued and consistently interesting book about the literary and social forms that railing can take.

In *Crowd and Rumour in Shakespeare*, Kai Wiegandt combines close analysis of six plays with an examination of the title's two central terms that is informed by history, sociology, and psychology. In part 1 of *Crowd and Rumour*, Weigandt considers the Renaissance conceptualization and iconography of the crowd; he also surveys recent theories of crowds that, in subsequent chapters, are applied to *2 Henry VI*, *Julius Caesar*, and *Coriolanus*. Part 2

begins with a chapter on early modern ideas about rumor, paying particular attention to that category's gradual differentiation from fame; from there we turn to modern theories about rumor, with subsequent chapters taking up Richard III, 2 Henry IV, and Othello. Wiegandt's analyses of Shakespeare's plays are astute. He reads the Falstaff of 2 Henry IV as "rumour's main agent," arguing that Hal's rejection of Falstaff also constitutes the final expulsion of stories about his dissolution (p. 143). Julius Caesar emerges as Shakespeare's most metatheatrical play, thanks to its "purposeful dissolution of the boundary between stage and audience as well as between stage and the limits of the theatre" (p. 62); it also demonstrates the intimate connection between theater and rhetoric as means of "manipulat[ing] not so much individuals but crowds" (p. 65). And Othello is ingeniously analyzed in terms of the links between rumor and skepticism: "rumours prepare skepticism and spring from it, thus forming a vicious circle of doubt" (p. 158). Crowd and Rumour in Shakespeare ably argues that Shakespeare's works are not merely "drama[s] of individuality" (p. 1), but also testaments to the playwright's "concern with man as an essentially collective being" (p. 2).

CRITICS AND CRITICISM

Volume 11 of The Shakespearean International Yearbook is a special issue, guest edited by Jonathan Gil Harris, devoted to essays that engage the important scholarship of Michael Neill. Both Harris's introduction and Neill's afterword eloquently work to "place" Neill geographically, biographically, and critically. Individual essays take up a range of topics associated with Neill's oeuvre: service (Adrian Poole, on animal and human loyalty; David Schalkwyk, on service and erotic desire; Macdonald P. Jackson, on the implications of the language of status for Shakespeare's potential part-authorship of Arden of Faversham); death and its iconography (Gail Kern Paster, on thinking with skulls); theatrical empathy (Marina Warner, on literary representations of Hecuba and memories of Troy); empire and colonization (Thomas Cartelli, on early modern English writing about Ireland; Harris, on the effects of India on European identities in travel writing); and cultural appropriations of Shakespeare (Shaul Bassi, on Italian Shakespeare criticism under Benito Mussolini; Jean E. Howard, on the impact of Othello, a critical touchstone for Neill, on Season of Migration to the North, a novel by the Sudanese writer Tayeb Salih; and Mark Houlahan, on "rehearsal fictions," most notably ones featuring [in Neill's spelling of the title] *Anthony and Cleopatra*). This volume serves as an eloquent testimonial to the range and influence of one of our most important critics of Renaissance drama.

Shakespeare and I is a collection of essays edited by William McKenzie and Theodora Papadopoulou, who in their introduction suggest the volume provides an antidote to "a kind of rigor mortis in contemporary criticism." They champion "a criticism that is committed to human creativity in literature and culture, and one which expresses and explores this commitment" (p. 4). In Shakespeare and I, such exploration is conducted through "self-writing": "writing as unique, irreplaceable and irreducibly personal as the self writing it" (p. 12). "Self-writing" takes different forms in this collection. Some essays are retrospective and autobiographical, such as Peter Holland's discussion of his youthful theatergoing. Thomas Docherty's reflections upon his schoolboy experience of A Midsummer Night's Dream, or Phillippa Kelly's reflections upon Hamlet and Lear in the wake of her brother's death. Other essays are further removed from biography: Julia Reinhold Lupton invents the persona of Mrs. Polonius in order to "hel[p] me care about things in Shakespeare, not only in order to better visualize the material conditions of his world, but also to pay renewed attention to my own" (p. 158). Still other pieces center upon the nature of the writer's response to particular plays, as in Ewan Fernie's examination of his complex identification with Measure for Measure's Angelo, and Eric Mallin's coordination of Othello to his own experience of marriage. (A few brief references to the Sonnets notwithstanding, Shakespeare the poet is absent from this volume.) All told, the collection includes thirteen examples of "self-writing" by prominent Shakespeareans—in addition to those mentioned above, David Fuller, Richard Wilson, Graham Holderness, Phillipa Berry, Philip Davis, Sarah Klenbort, and Simon Palfrey contribute essays, with Paul Edmondson supplying an afterword.

Neil Corcoran's *Shakespeare* and the Modern Poet focuses on the engagement of W. B. Yeats, T. S. Eliot, W. H. Auden, and Ted Hughes with Shakespeare, through both their poetry and critical commentary. Corcoran's contention is that these poets work out their relations to both their precursors and contemporaries via Shakespeare. (The book begins with allusions to Harold Bloom's *The Anxiety of Influence.*) Corcoran's introduction examines how twentieth-century poetic practice is informed by Shakespeare,

arguing, for instance, that "Modernist difficulty is sanctioned by Shakespearean practice; and Shakespeare becomes the first modern(ist)" (p. 4). Corcoran ably traces the complex, sometimes contradictory ways in which Shakespeare registers for modern poets. For example, he discusses how Yeats gives us a Shakespeare who, in one instance, is "a modern poet of mask, image and mirror" (p. 40), and in another is "a member of 'the old nation'" (p. 41). If, as Corcoran puts it, Shakespeare "become[s] a usable tool in Eliot's poetry workshop," the poet remains keenly aware of the difficulties posed by Shakespeare's outsized influence: any writer of poetic drama must try to "escape from the constricting toils of Shakespeare," says Eliot. Interestingly, Eliot's imagined writer of dramatic poetry sounds very much like a Spenserian hero, maintaining "perpetual poetic vigilance" (Corcoran's phrase) in order not to produce ersatz Shakespearean verse (p. 82). Ted Hughes's Shakespeare is "double," both "the [individualistic] poet of instinctive energies and untamed territories" and the "Poet Laureate ... officer of the Royal Household responsible to the idea of 'a nation'" (p. 197). As Corcoran suggests, this "double Shakespeare" resembles the refracted self-image of Hughes. Corcoran's book ably demonstrates that, for these four poets, as well as other major modernist writers, Shakespeare is "a figure of central, consuming, protean and permanent critical as well as poetic concern" (p. 23).

In the same vein as Corcoran's work, four books appeared this year in the Great Shakespeareans series, which is "designed to explore those figures who have had the greatest influence on the interpretation, understanding and reception of Shakespeare, both nationally and internationally" (Holland and Poole, "Series Editors' Preface"). Crystal Bartolovich, Jean E. Howard, and David Hillman are the authors of a book on Karl Marx (essays by Bartolovich and Howard) and Sigmund Freud (Hillman); Daniel Albright is editor of a volume featuring chapters on Hector Berlioz (Peter Bloom), Giuseppe Verdi (Albright), Richard Wagner (Daniel Trippett), and Benjamin Britten (Seth Brodsky); Poole takes the helm for a tome on James Joyce (Maud Ellmann), Eliot (Anne Stillman), Auden (Jeremy Noel-Tod), and Samuel Beckett (Dan Gunn); and William Empson (Lars Engle), G. Wilson Knight (Michael Taylor), C. L. Barber (Peter Erickson), and Jan Kott (Madalina Nicolaescu; Zoltán Márkus) are the subjects of Hugh Grady's edited volume. Taken together, these books attest to the historical range and cultural dynamism of Shakespeare's legacy.

SOURCES AND APPROPRIATION

Richard Hillman's French Reflections in the Shakespearean Tragic: Three Case Studies argues for the influence of a range of early modern French texts on Hamlet, Antony and Cleopatra, and All's Well that Ends Well. (Hillman reads Shakespeare's "problem play" as poised on the cusp of tragedy.) Hillman identifies three Hamlets constructed out of French literary and cultural materials: a philosophical Hamlet drawing on Michel Montaigne; a political Hamlet indebted to a range of texts and historical events involving Antoine de Bourbon; and a psychological Hamlet derived from two tales by Francois de Belleforest (not merely the oft-noted source story of Amleth). Hillman sees conflicting attitudes toward Marc Antony in works by Shakespeare, Samuel Daniel, and Mary Sidney Herbert, Countess of Pembroke as being in the tradition of "two French Antonies," one the loyal friend of Julius Caesar and the other the "hedonist who ruins himself for Cleopatra" (p. 94). Hillman acknowledges the primacy of Sir Thomas North's Plutarch as a source for Antony and Cleopatra, but argues also that the play is informed by Jacques Amyot's translation, from which North's was derived. As for All's Well, Hillman builds the case for additional sources to the tale of Giletta of Narbonne, drawn from Giovanni Boccaccio and appearing in William Painter's Palace of Pleasure; for instance, "both [Bertram's] dreams of glory and the old king's nostalgia have close counterparts in the autobiographical Commentaries of the famous commander Blaise de Monluc (or Montluc, c. 1500-77)" (p. 157). Perhaps, but did Shakespeare need Monluc to represent the military ardor of youth and the backward gaze of old age? Hillman's intriguing analyses are not always convincing, as when he speculates that Sidney's friend Hubert Languet was "fictionally recycled" as *Hamlet's Horatio* (p. 54).

Stuart Sillars's *Shakespeare*, *Time*, and the Victorians: A Pictorial Exploration considers a range of visual materials—book illustrations, costume and set designs, paintings, photographs—in order to show how Victorian conceptions of historical time inform the presentation, representation, and recollection of Shakespeare's plays. For Sillars, a temporal paradox emerges out of the Victorian desire for historical fidelity and the culture's often unexamined belief that the present age marked a high point in Western civilization: the pre-Raphaelites "see[k] to rebuild the ethical and social foundations of the Middle Ages" while also employing "with no trace of irony ... the most recent and innovative elements of contemporary scientific advance" (pp. 77–8); actor-managers

such as Charles Kean assume that "Shakespeare suffered from the inadequacy of his theatres, and would have exploited the full range of Victorian technology had it been available to him" (p. 26). Sillars also considers how in the mid- to late-Victorian era "the fragmentation of the plays through quotation, anthologising and other devices ... fractured and discarded their complete performative dynamic" (p. 188): individual episodes or even lines of text formed the bases for paintings, engravings, and photographs. Similarly, character portraits abstracted figures such as Imogen, Portia, or Hamlet from the works in which they appeared, giving them "a sentient existence outside the plays' temporality" (p. 229). At the same time, the affinities between late-Victorian portraits and stage tableaux raised representational questions for both media: "If staging leans toward the painterly, what effect does this have on the temporal progression of the play?" (p. 254). Sillars also considers how visual illustrations inform memories of specific productions. Shakespeare, Time, and the Victorians not only offers a lavishly illustrated account of Victorian visual representations, it also wonderfully explicates the ways in which the interplay between media contributed to the cultural production of a distinctly Victorian Shakespeare.

Shakespeare in America by Alden T. Vaughan and Virginia Mason Vaughan offers a lively and readable overview of its topic. which is "Shakespeare's American history from its colonial origins ... to the twenty-first century's uncertain future" (p. 1). In doing so, the authors identify and develop specific themes they believe to be "characteristic of Shakespeare in America," such as the accommodation of Shakespeare to a didactic, self-improving approach to literature; the importance of "enterprising individuals who brought their ingenuity and energy to Shakespeare in ways that revolutionized his cultural impact" (p. 2); the "seldom reverential" nature of American engagement with the Bard (p. 4): and the egalitarian impulse to make Shakespeare available to all, regardless of race or class. While the early chapters proceed chronologically, the later ones tether history to themes such as multiculturalism, popular culture, and even "professional Shakespeare" (a chapter, centered upon academic trends, that is likely to be of the least interest to the general reader). Throughout, there is fascinating material on topics such as colonial theatrical performances, Shakespeare and the founding fathers, the authorship controversy, and twentieth-century Shakespeare festivals. Shakespeare in America stands as a lucid introduction to an important topic in Shakespeare studies.

INTERNATIONAL SHAKESPEARE

The essays in Shakespeare and the Second World War: Memory, Culture, Identity, edited by Irena R. Makaryk and Marissa McHugh, examine "the vexed interrelations among war, Shakespeare, nationalism, political exigency, collective memory, and collective identity" (p. 5). Most of the essays in this volume focus on productions staged during the war, although the final three (by McHugh, Tibor Egervari, and Katarzyna Kwapisz Williams) consider more recent adaptations and productions (in Canada, France, and Poland). Shakespeare and the Second World War is consistently fascinating and wide-ranging in scope. For example, Nancy Isenberg shows how Julius Caesar was "called up to aid and abet Fascist ideological programs" in Mussolini's Italy (p. 83). Moreover, in his 1953 film of the play, Joseph Mankiewicz mistakenly took the trappings of Mussolini's stagings of power to be of classical origin, thereby "falsely impact[ing] the collective imagination worldwide of ancient Rome" (p. 99). Ryuta Minami demonstrates the complexity of the Japanese response to Shakespeare, who served as both an "icon of the enemy culture and an object of desire in wartime Japan" (p. 164). Peter Billingham tells the compelling story of the all-female Osiris Players, who toured wartime Britain, while Anne Russell examines the G.I. Hamlet, a 1944 production of Shakespeare's most famous tragedy produced for U.S. Army troops. Zeno Ackermann takes up German productions of The Merchant of Venice, while Mark Bayer draws our attention to Zionist and Arab understandings of the play in the early days of the Arab-Israeli conflict. Shakespeare and the Second World War also features essays by Werner Habicht, Tina Krontiris, Krstyna Kujawińska Courtney, Aleksei Semenenko, Ryuta Minami, Alexander C. Y. Huang, and Simon Barker.

Shakespeare in Kabul, by Stephen Landrigan and Qais Akbar Omar, is the affecting story of a mixed-gender production of Love's Labours Lost performed by Afghani actors in 2005 under the direction of Corinne Jaber. Love's Labours Lost appealed because of the strong female characters, as well as the equal number of men and women in the main plot; the setting was changed to Afghanistan, with the King of Navarre now alliteratively ruling over Kabul. The book narrates the history of the production, from the choice of play through rehearsals to enormously successful performances. The delight is in the details, as in the story behind the decision, made over Jaber's resistance, to replace the male lovers' Russian disguises with Indian ones instantly recognizable from

Bollywood films. Most important of all is the historic nature of the production—the first post-Taliban performance to feature a cast comprised of men and women. As such, this *Love's Labours Lost* intimated a brighter future for Afghanistan, but one obviously yet to be realized. The final chapter of the book describes the killing of the husband of Parwin Mushtahel because of her theatrical activities, as well as the frantic, successful efforts made to relocate her and her children to Canada. Nevertheless, *Shakespeare* in Kabul is more triumphant than tragic. In 2012, Mushatel and other actors from the company known as the Rah-e-Sabz ("Path of Hope") performed a Dari version of *The Comedy of Errors* in venues around the world.

In Hamlet's Arab Journey: Shakespeare's Prince and Nasser's Ghost, Margaret Litvin offers a fascinating account of Arab conceptions of Hamlet from the middle of the twentieth-century. She develops the model of the "global kaleidoscope" to account for the complexity of Arab cultural encounters with Shakespeare, which answer neither to the "Prospero-and-Caliban paradigm" (p. 58), in which a colonized people learns to curse its oppressors in the language those oppressors have taught them, nor to a direct, unmediated engagement with Shakespeare's play. Instead, Arab Hamlets were informed by a variety of Shakespearean traditions, including French, Italian, Eastern European, and Soviet ones (Grigori Kozintsev's 1964 film was particularly influential). Both the character of Hamlet and key lines from the play function powerfully within Arab cultures. As Litvin shows, "to be or not to be" proliferates in popular discourse as a question not for the Arab subject but for broader Arab and/or Muslim communities and nations—are we to be or not? Litvin's study also charts the history of the figure of the "Arab Hero Hamlet," who becomes dominant in the wake of Gamal Abdel Nasser's death in 1970. Two early 1970s adaptations of the play give us the archetype: "a revolutionary martyr for justice who dies confronting a repressive regime" (p. 115). However, in the wake of political disappointments, this figure comes to be ironized in original works such as Hamlet Wakes Up Late by the Syrian playwright Mamduh Adwan (1976) or Forget Hamlet by the Iraqi playwright Jawad al-Assadi (1994). Litvin memorably tethers Hamlet's Arab journey to recent history in a lucid and engaging fashion.

Strangers in Early Modern English Texts, edited by Jesús López-Peláez, examines Othello and a variety of other plays in the service of considering "the majesty of the powerful other" mainly, but not exclusively, on the Renaissance stage (p. 14). Luciano

García tracks "the presence of the lexeme 'Moor' in a wide selection of English dramatic texts of the early modern period" (p. 66) in order to establish some of that term's dominant connotations. Jesús Nieto and Cinta Zunino argue that the non-English characters in George Peele's The Battle of Alcazar demonstrate "different forms and grades of otherness" depending upon their political and ideological compatibility with Elizabethan foreign policy at the end of the 1580s (p. 106). John Drakakis demonstrates that, in Marlowe and Shakespeare, "When Venetians become the object of scrutiny from the perspective of those they subject, then the imaginary that they view in the mirror that shapes their subjectivity is nothing less than the 'otherness' of their own ethos" (p. 125). The "problematization of the Spanish Morisco" in both Othello and Pedro Calderón de la Barca's Tuzaní is the subject of an essay by López-Peláez (p. 127), while Rüdiger Ahrens considers plurivocality and alterity in Othello and The Merchant of Venice. Strangers in Early Modern English Texts also includes chapters by José Ruiz, Eroulla Demetriou, María Paz López-Peláez, and Yolanda Caballero.

BIOGRAPHY

Lois Potter's The Life of William Shakespeare: A Critical Biography offers sensitive and erudite analyses of Shakespeare's works and their place in Renaissance literary culture. Scrupulously researched, Potter's Life is a literary biography first and foremost, and its myriad pleasures emerge out of Potter's close attention to both poems and plays and the social and institutional circumstances of their composition, performance, and distribution. Almost every page brings fresh insights or salutary reminders. For example, Potter's discussion of 1 Henry VI brings into focus its innovatory nature by contrasting it with contemporary history plays: "The anonymous Fair Em purports to be about William the Conqueror but confines itself to his imaginary love life. The Famous Victories of Henry V draws on widely accepted notions about the king's wild youth, and his military successes in France are interspersed with numerous scenes of clowning" (p. 90). Of Shakespeare's greatest history play, 1 Henry IV, Potter observes that it is a "fusion of humors comedy with history" (p. 207). While acknowledging the potential problem with dating, Potter also makes the provocative case for Twelfth Night as the "earliest Hamlet parody" (p. 287), with Malvolio in the role of melancholy prince. And she rightly draws the reader's attention to the fact that *Venus and Adonis* was "probably [Shakespeare's] best-known work until the publication of the 1623 Folio" (p. 117). Several pages are devoted to the performance of *The Comedy of Errors* at the 1594 Christmas Revels at Gray's Inn, just as attention is paid throughout to companies as well as specific theatrical "seasons." Additionally, there is much to learn about Marlowe, Kyd, Greene, Fletcher, and others in the pages of Potter's *Life*, which concludes with chapters on the afterlives of Shakespeare and his works. This is a learned, lucid, and captivating work.

This year's most imaginative biography is Graham Holderness's engaging Nine Lives of William Shakespeare. In his introduction, Holderness tackles the problem that all Shakespeare's biographers have to face, which is the bare-bones nature of the historical record, comprised entirely of public documents. Holderness usefully differentiates biographical "facts" (Shakespeare was baptized on 26 April 1564 and died on 23 April 1616) from "traditions" (Shakespeare had to leave Stratford for London after being caught poaching deer) and "speculations" (Shakespeare's Catholic sympathies). This tripartite distinction provides the structure for each of the nine "possible 'lives' that can reasonably be drawn around the basic facts, traditions and literary remains of the Shakespeare legacy" (p. 17). However, Holderness goes one step further by concluding each "life" with a "metabiographical" fiction that synthesizes material drawn from his three central categories. For example, "Life Two," entitled "Shakespeare the Player," ends with a first-person account, drawing upon fact, speculation, and relevant material from Hamlet, of a player receiving direction in acting from Shakespeare. "Life Six," which centers upon the possibility of Shakespeare's love for Henry Wriothsley, Earl of Southampton, concludes with "The Adventure of Shakespeare's Ring," a story in the style of Sir Arthur Conan Doyle that plays off of one another the relationships of Shakespeare and Southampton, Sherlock Holmes and John Watson, and Oscar Wilde and Lord Alfred Douglas. Holderness's approach will not be to everyone's taste, but Nine Lives's frank exploitation of the creative dimension of literary biography is refreshing. Additionally, the "stories" concluding each of the nine lives have serious points to make about the often unexamined ways in which we suture literary texts to the details (real and invented) of their authors' lives.

Ian Donaldson's *Ben Jonson: A Life* is wonderfully readable and erudite. Donaldson demonstrates that "Jonson's own life ... was subject to more ebb, diversion, and counter-current than his own stoical declarations have led biographers to assume" (p. 12).

After a prologue, the biography begins with Jonson's walking trip to Scotland in 1618–19, at which point Jonson was "Britain's first literary celebrity" (p. 41). That Jonson ever thrived is extraordinary given his propensity to scoff at the hand that feeds him: he suffered imprisonment for his part in writing The Isle of Dogs and Eastward Ho!, as well as for dueling with and slaying an actor, Gabriel Spencer; he converted to Catholicism in 1598 (and returned to Anglicanism in 1610 after the assassination by a Catholic of French king Henri IV led to a crackdown in England), and even dined with the Gunpowder plotters, raising questions about his knowledge of their plans; late in his career, Jonson persisted in disparaging Inigo Jones in explicit contradiction of Charles I's wishes—and this when he heavily relied on Charles's patronage. Donaldson admirably situates Jonson's life in relation to the politics and culture of his day. Throughout, he offers insightful commentary on Jonson's works, from the "new species of comic writing" of his early "humours" plays, which "challenged the basic terms and territory upon which comedy in England ... had been played out" (p. 152), to late works such as The Staple of News, in which Jonson seemed to "glimpse at moments aspects of the world in which we live today" (p. 397). He concludes his *Life* with a chapter on Jonson's posthumous reputation, which followed "a steadily rising curve throughout the century following his death, followed by a steep descent from the early Romantic period" (p. 430). Inevitably, Shakespeare casts a shadow over Ben Jonson: A *Life*—Jonson's posthumous decline in fortune is inseparable from Shakespeare's rise—but Donaldson does a commendable job both of rendering Jonson's life vivid and of conveying the fascination and historical significance of his works.

THEATER HISTORY

Tim Fitzpatrick's *Playwright, Space, and Place in Early Modern Performance: Shakespeare and Company* argues for theatrical spatial conventions that would both dictate the representation of place and enable the effective management of players' comings and goings. These conventions are built around the two stage doors through which players made their entrances and exits (Fitzpatrick argues against the idea that the third door to the tiring house would be used for this purpose). That is, the stage doors are the architectural foundation for "a *relational* spatial system" flexible enough to establish "different sets of spatial polarities between the 'here' represented by the stage and the 'there' or 'theres,'

one or more unseen counter-places, that are taken to be located offstage" (p. 65). In describing a basic form of this system, Fitzpatrick shows that in a given scene "the stage space represents or 'stands for' a place which is 'in between' two other offstage places" (p. 23), which are in turn each identified with one of the stage doors. This flexible spatial system could also be used to simplify entrances and exits for the players (a crucial issue in a theatrical culture that featured minimal rehearsal), as one door would be conventionally designated for "inward" spaces and the other for "outward" ones. Although this system requires "audience 'amnesia'" insofar as rapid changes of location demand the ability to "wipe and reset' the spatial connotations of the stage and its doors" (p. 235), Fitzpatrick concludes his book by suggesting how, through linguistic and spatial echoes, particular scenes might hauntingly evoke earlier ones from the same play. That the door to Lady Macbeth's bedchamber would have served earlier as the door to Duncan's underscores Lady Macbeth's "obsessive returning to the 'scene of the crime'" through her conscience-stricken dialogue (p. 237). Fitzpatrick demonstrates that this "relational spatial system" both constitutes a conceptual resource exploited by playwright and players and establishes for the audience a horizon of expectations.

Janette Dillon's Shakespeare and the Staging of English History centers upon the "scenic units" distinctive to the Shakespearean history play. She pays particular attention to what she terms "stage pictures"—"emblems or pageants [that hold] certain kinds of meaning still in visual and symbolic form" (p. 8). Dillon contends that stage pictures are misunderstood if evaluated in terms of realism, verisimilitude, or even character. For example, Jack Cade's encounter with Alexander Iden in the latter's garden in 2 Henry VI is a moment at which "[i]t is as though a real man ... suddenly enters an allegorical world in which an allegorical guide-figure sets before him the idea, or idealized essence, of 'the garden' ... [A]n idea is rhetorically 'frozen' for the audience to contemplate its didactic meaning" (p. 14). Such moments of rhetorical freezing recur throughout the history plays, as in John of Gaunt's famous speech in Richard II, which "seems to rise above and supersede the immediate context that has prompted it and to invite both the onstage and the offstage audience to ... consider its significance in the greater scheme of things" (p. 97). Dillon focuses on a variety of "scenic units" throughout her analysis, including soliloquies, which function in a way that is analogous to the cinematic close-up; the choric role of "presenters," who offer "an alternative, not an objective, perspective" (p. 25) on events (Falstaff looms large here); the spatial arrangement of players and properties along both vertical and horizontal axes; and the "ceremonial objects of history—crown, throne, sceptre, robes, and so on—that become the symbolic objects that draw the spectator's gaze on stage" and around whose positioning and movement "the narrative of history is typically structured" (p. 54). Dillon's analysis is consistently provocative, and she illuminates Shakespeare's historical dramaturgy in fine fashion.

Volume 1 of British Drama, 1533-1642: A Catalogue, edited by Martin Wiggins in association with Catherine Richardson, covers the years 1533 to 1566. It is an extraordinarily useful compendium of "identifiable dramatic works, both extant and lost, written by English, Welsh, Irish and Scottish authors, in all languages" (p. ix). Entries for extant plays are capacious. For instance, the entry for Nicholas Udall's Roister Doister tells us not only when it was printed (1566), but also that it "contains revisions made after 1533" (p. 245). We are given the names not only of characters with roles in the play, but also of those only alluded to in the text. There are lists of sources for the play, the metrical forms it deploys, music and sound effects, props, and costumes. Information is provided not only about its early textual history but also its major modern editions. Of course, not all plays can be treated so exhaustively; we learn little of an unnamed wedding masque from 1558 other than its genre, site of production, and one or two details about music and costuming—this because the masque exists now only as an entry in Henry Machyn's diary (p. 324). Another suggestive entry, on a 1564 production of Edward Halliwell's Dido, features extensive production details derived from Abraham Hartwell's Regina Literata (1565), including the fact that Lord Robert Dudley, Sir William Cecil, and Elizabeth I were in attendance (pp. 404-5). One finds oneself thinking not only about the commonplace association of Elizabeth with Dido (sometimes named Eliza), but also about possible connections with other Renaissance retellings of the story of Dido and Aeneas, such as Marlowe's Dido, Queen of Carthage. This first volume of British Drama 1533–1642: A Catalogue is filled with such riches. Scholars of Renaissance drama will find it to be both useful and fascinating.

PERFORMERS AND PERFORMANCES

Shakespeare on Stage: Thirteen Leading Actors on Thirteen Key Roles is a series of interviews conducted by Julian Curry that focus upon significant productions staged between 1960 and 2009. Among those that Curry interviews are Ian McKellen, Helen Mirren, Judi Dench, Derek Jacobi, Kevin Spacey, and Brian Cox. As the title suggests, these actors each reflect upon his or her interpretation of a significant Shakespearean character, while also discussing the director's vision, the rehearsal process, and the relationship of the production to its cultural moment. The interviews are consistently interesting and often illuminating, a testament to Curry's preparation and knowledge of plays and productions. Adrian Lester's discussion of Nicholas Hytner's 2003 Henry V at the National Theatre, performed in the early stages of the Iraq War, is particularly fascinating, as life and art mirror one another: "As we were rehearsing, some British commander used Henry's St. Crispin's Day speech to his soldiers before they went into a town" (p. 123). McKellen, discussing his Macbeth in a 1976 RSC performance, situates the play in relation to Watergate: "When we were rehearsing ... I said, 'Well, of course, they're the Nixons, aren't they?' And [director] Trevor Nunn said, 'No, no, they're not the Nixons, they're the Kennedys'" (p. 152). Mirren (Antony and Cleopatra, three productions from 1965, 1982, and 1998) is wonderful on Cleopatra as a character motivated by love and power; for her, Antony and Cleopatra "love each other's myths as much as they love each other" (p. 175). Jude Law, star of Michael Grandage's 2009 Donmar Warehouse Hamlet, offers insightful comments about the difference between Hamlet's friendships to Horatio, on the one hand, and Rosencrantz and Guildenstern, on the other, while Patrick Stewart (The Tempest, 2006, RSC) develops the implications of Prospero being afraid of Ariel. Other actors interviewed in Shakespeare on Stage are Ralph Fiennes, Rebecca Hall, Tim Piggott-Smith, and Penelope Wilton.

Sweet William: Twenty Thousand Hours with Shakespeare is an expanded version of a one-man show by the distinguished actor Michael Pennington. While it takes up details of the playwright's biography, Sweet William is primarily the record of Pennington's lifelong experience with Shakespeare, which began when, as an eleven-year-old, he witnessed an Old Vic production of Macbeth. Pennington writes about Shakespeare with intelligence and verve. For instance, he alludes to "the glorious frustration we all feel about Shakespeare, always—his manipulation of metaphor to the

point that it becomes an alternative reality" (p. 37). Tacitly contesting claims about the timelessness of Shakespeare's characters, Pennington dubs the playwright "very unlike a modern writer. He seems to regard 'character' as fluid or even non-existent until the moment of speech ... and even then as expendable if some more poetic purpose can be served" (p. 147). That shrewd point notwithstanding, Pennington is insightful about Shakespeare's characters, as when he notes that "Leontes may be sure of his rectitude, but the more he threatens the smaller he feels, almost shrinking from sight as he rants and raves" (p. 234). Moreover, his judgments are well informed if sometimes provocative: "Coriolanus attracts impetuous thinking" (p. 265), while Taming of the Shrew's Bianca subplot is "exceptionally dreary," with "a notable shortage of grace, wit or affection" (p. 118). As its subtitle suggests, Sweet William is the product of a fine actor's sustained and sensitive engagement with the early modern playwright.

EDITIONS

2012 saw the release of a number of distinguished editions of early modern plays, both Shakespearean and non-. Karen Britland's edition of Elizabeth Cary's The Tragedy of Mariam is affordable, portable, and well glossed, with a brief introduction covering the author's life and the play's major themes. Matthew R. Martin's edition of Marlowe's *The Jew of Malta* usefully supplements the play with period texts focused on the topics of Jewishness in England, European-Ottoman relations, Machiavellianism, and Marlowe's reputation. René Weis's Romeo and Juliet lives up to the high standards of the Arden Shakespeare, with an extensive introduction, expansive editorial glosses, and even a facsimile reproduction of Q1 in an appendix. For the New Cambridge Shakespeare series, Robert Kean Turner and Patricia Tatspaugh have produced an elegant, well-annotated Two Noble Kinsmen, with an introduction that touches upon a range of topics, including Shakespeare and Fletcher's coauthorship, Shakespeare's late style, and the play's performance history. The Tragedie of Macbeth appears in Demitra Papadinis's "Frankly Annotated First Folio Edition." The play is overwhelmed by Papadinis's glosses, which range from the illuminating to the misleading (Lady Macbeth's imagined unsexing connotes both androgyny and the fact that "she herself has the 'balls'" to kill Duncan [I.v.79-80n]). Finally, this year brought us the first volume of The Collected Works of John Ford, edited by Gilles Monsarrat, Brian Vickers and R. J.

C. Watt. While the publication of this elegant, scholarly volume will be applauded by fans of the great dramatist, they will have to wait longer for the plays themselves: volume 1 is devoted to Ford's poems and prose works, including *Honor Triumphant*, *Fames Memoriall*, and *A Funerall Elegye for William Peter*.

EXHIBITION CATALOGS

Two museum exhibitions provided the occasion for a pair of beautiful catalogs. Remembering Shakespeare, by David Scott Kastan and Kathyrn James, accompanied an exhibition at Yale University's Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library. Through a range of materials owned by Yale, the book tells the story of how Shakespeare has been remembered and reconstituted over time. To specialists, the narrative will be largely familiar, if not always uncontroversial in its details: Shakespeare's indifference to the printing of his plays; his monumentalization through the First Folio; "improvements" made to his plays by Nahum Tate; the subsequent "restoration" of his works by Nicolas Rowe; and the Bard's gradual cultural elevation and the broad dissemination and appropriation of his works. Such familiarity notwithstanding, anyone interested in Shakespeare will take pleasure in the printed and manuscript materials beautifully reproduced in this handsome volume.

While Remembering Shakespeare unfolds diachronically and centers primarily on the written word, Jonathan Bate and Dora Thornton's Shakespeare: Staging the World draws upon a rich assortment of cultural materials in order to situate the playwright's works in their time. Produced to accompany an exhibition of the same name at the British Museum, Shakespeare: Staging the World contains learned and readable scholarly essays on topics such as "London, circa. 1612: World City," "Beware the Ides of March': The Legacy of Rome," "The Noble Moor," and "The Matter of Britain: Past, Present and Future." Illustrating these essays are photographs of a wide range of objects—paintings, tapestries, jewels, maps, sculptures, medals, and much more—that are frequently accompanied by snippets of texts from Shakespeare. For example, Sebastian's ironic assertion in *The Tempest* that "Now I will believe / That there are unicorns" is adjacent to the photograph of a narwhal tusk, collected in the period as a unicorn horn (pp. 242-43); Macbeth's allusion to "supernatural soliciting" is juxtaposed with charm stones used "against disease or the working of witchcraft in people or animals" (p. 204); and a line

from *As You Like It* captions a woven valance for a posted bed that features pastoral scenes of hunting and lovemaking (pp. 64–5). *Shakespeare: Staging the World* is a gorgeous book; it is also a remarkable resource for anyone interested in the literature and culture of sixteenth- and seventeenth-century England.

THE EXCEPTION THAT PROVES THE RULE

In a year dominated by the Bard, The Oxford Handbook of Thomas Middleton, edited by Gary Taylor and Trish Thomas Henley, comes as a welcome reminder that there are more things in heaven and earth than Shakespeare. The non-handbook-ness of the volume is striking: the essays are organized in reverse alphabetical order by name of contributor, which means we begin with an essay by Julian Yates on (especially) The Owle's Almanacke and conclude with Mary Bly's discussion of Your Five Gallants in relation to an emergent "lust for fashion" in early modern culture (p. 603). The range of topics is impressive. Courtney Lehmann argues that the recent ascendance of Middleton on film speaks to the emergence of "a cinematic and contemporary culture that has decidedly entered a Jacobean or, better put, a neo-noir phase" (p. 211). Heidi Brayman Hackel directs our attention "to early moderns who could not hear and ... explore[s] moments on the early modern English stage when 'the complete "action" did not include speaking" (p. 330); she reads Middleton's dumb shows as "complex assertions of silence and meaning available in the body" (p. 344). Carol Chillington Rutter considers what we can learn about early modern boys' companies through a 2009 production of A Mad World, My Masters put on by a troupe of male students at King Edward VI School in Stratford-upon-Avon. And Tiffany Stern demonstrates that Middleton "does not seem to have had a sense that a song 'belonged' exclusively to its play"; instead, "songs might be variously relevant over time depending on company and ability" (p. 78). The Handbook features 30 additional essays by equally distinguished contributors on topics such as Spain (Barbara Fuchs), usury (David Hawkes), mimetic desire (Lars Engle), ecological change (Bruce Boehrer), music (Raphael Seligmann), linguistic experimentation (Stephen Guy-Bray), and the passions (Gail Kern Paster). The Oxford Handbook of Thomas Middleton deserves its place alongside the groundbreaking Oxford Collected Works of 2007.

The criticism of 2012 does not lend itself to strong pronouncements about the new places to which our scholarship is heading. Neither does it sanction confident assertions about what we are leaving behind: while book history, theater history, the new materialism, and performance and film studies were underrepresented. it seems unlikely that any of them are on the wane. Of course, we are all waiting for the death of the book. And waiting. And waiting. This past year does not suggest its moment has come—and amen to that. And yet, one cannot help but think that the ongoing crisis in scholarly publication has contributed to our near-obsessive critical emphasis on Shakespeare—the Bard sells, when so many others do not. (Alas, The Oxford Handbook of Thomas Middleton is not currently priced to move.) There are, of course, numerous other contributing factors, including protocols for tenure and promotion that help drive our research; and there is a great deal to be said for devoting one's energies to the works of one of the greatest playwrights and poets in world history. Still, it's hard not to wish for a scholarly universe in which "Shakespeare's contemporaries" played a larger role, even if only because their achievement can help us better understand the nature of his. As I mentioned at the beginning of this essay, Shakespeare is the language that we all speak; it's unfortunate that we aren't quite as fluent in other tongues. And yet, as many of this year's books demonstrate, what a language it is!

BOOKS RECEIVED

Albright, Daniel, ed. *Berlioz, Verdi, Wagner, Britten*. Great Shakespeareans 11. Gen. series eds. Peter Holland and Adrian Poole. London and New York: Continuum, 2012. Pp. xii + 246. \$140.00. ISBN 978-1-4411-7909-8.

Baldo, Jonathan. *Memory in Shakespeare's Histories: Stages of Forgetting in Early Modern England.* Routledge Studies in Shakespeare 8. New York and Abingdon UK: Routledge, 2012. Pp. x + 208. \$125.00. ISBN 978-0-415-89683-2.

Bartolovich, Crystal, Jean E. Howard, and David Hillman, eds. *Marx and Freud*. Great Shakespeareans 10. Gen. series eds. Peter Holland and Adrian Poole. London and New York: Continuum, 2012. Pp. x + 221. \$140.00. ISBN 978-1-4411-6664-7.

Bate, Jonathan, and Dora Thornton. *Shakespeare: Staging the World.* London: British Library; New York and Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 2012. Pp. 304. \$39.95. ISBN 978-0-19-991501-9.

Benson, Sean. *Shakespeare, "Othello," and Domestic Tragedy.* Continuum Shakespeare Studies. London and New York: Continuum, 2012. Pp. x + 173. \$110.00. ISBN 978-1-4411-9470-1.

Brayton, Dan. *Shakespeare's Ocean: An Ecocritical Exploration*. Under the Sign of Nature: Explorations in Ecocriticism. Ed. Michael P. Branch, SueEllen Campbell, and John Tallmadge. Charlottesville and London: Univ. of Virginia Press, 2012. Pp. xviii + 257. \$40.00. ISBN 978-0-8139-3226-2.

Bromley, James M. *Intimacy and Sexuality in the Age of Shake-speare*. Cambridge and New York: Cambridge Univ. Press, 2012. Pp. viii + 210. \$95.00. ISBN 978-1-107-01518-0.

Canning, Patricia. *Style in the Renaissance: Language and Ideology in Early Modern England.* Advances in Stylistics. Series ed. Dan McIntyre. London and New York: Continuum, 2012. Pp. x + 209. \$140.00. ISBN 978-1-4411-8552-5.

Cary, Elizabeth. *The Tragedy of Mariam*. Ed. Karen Britland. New Mermaids. Gen. eds. William C. Carroll, Brian Gibbons, and Tiffany Stern. London: Methuen Drama / A and C Black Publishers, 2010. Pp. xxxii + 101. £8.99 paper. ISBN 978-0-7136-8876-4.

Chartier, Roger. *Cardenio entre Cervantès et Shakespeare: Histoire d'une Pièce Perdue*. NRF Essais. Paris: Éditions Gallimard, 2011. Pp. 375. €15.90. ISBN 978-2-07-012387-2.

Christofides, R. M. Shakespeare and the Apocalypse: Visions of Doom from Early Modern Tragedy to Popular Culture. Continuum Shakespeare Studies. London and New York: Continuum, 2012. Pp. xviii + 216. \$110.00. ISBN 978-1-4411-7994-4.

Cohen, Adam Max. *Wonder in Shakespeare*. Houndmills UK and New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012. Pp. x + 226. \$85.00. ISBN 978-0-230-10541-6.

Corcoran, Neil. *Shakespeare and the Modern Poet*. Cambridge and New York: Cambridge Univ. Press, 2010. Pp. vi + 248. \$89.00. ISBN 978-0-521-19982-7.

Curry, Julian. Shakespeare on Stage: Thirteen Leading Actors on Thirteen Key Roles. Foreword by Trevor Nunn. London: Nick Hern, 2010. Pp. xvi + 255. £14.99 paper. ISBN 978-1-84842-077-9.

DeCook, Travis, and Alan Galey, eds. *Shakespeare, the Bible, and the Form of the Book: Contested Scriptures*. Routledge Studies in Shakespeare 5. New York and Abingdon UK: Routledge, 2012. Pp. xii + 207. \$133.00. ISBN 978-0-415-88350-4.

Dillon, Janette. *Shakespeare and the Staging of English History*. Oxford Shakespeare Topics. Oxford and New York: Oxford Univ. Press, 2012. Pp. viii + 150. \$27.95 paper. ISBN 978-0-19-959315-6.

Donaldson, Ian. *Ben Jonson: A Life.* Oxford: Oxford Univ. Press, 2011. Pp. xx + 533. \$39.95. ISBN 978-0-19-812976-9.

Enterline, Lynn. *Shakespeare's Schoolroom: Rhetoric, Discipline, Emotion.* Philadelphia: Univ. of Pennsylvania Press, 2012. Pp. 202. \$45.00. ISBN 978-0-8122-4378-9.

Estok, Simon C. *Ecocriticism and Shakespeare: Reading Ecophobia*. Literatures, Cultures, and the Environment. Ed. Ursula K. Heise. Houndmills UK and New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011. Pp. x + 182. \$80.00. ISBN 978-0-230-11256-8.

Feather, Jennifer. Writing Combat and the Self in Early Modern English Literature: The Pen and the Sword. Early Modern Cultural Studies, 1500–1700. Series eds. Jean Howard and Ivo Kamps. Houndmills UK and New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011. Pp. xviii + 254. \$85.00. ISBN 978-0-230-12041-9.

Feerick, Jean E., and Vin Nardizzi, eds. *The Indistinct Human in Renaissance Literature*. Early Modern Cultural Studies. Series eds. Jean Howard and Ivo Kamps. Houndmills UK and New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012. Pp. xii + 292. \$90.00. ISBN 978-0-230-34047-3.

Feldman, Sabrina. *The Apocryphal William Shakespeare*. Book One of A "Third Way" Shakespeare Authorship Scenario. Indianapolis: Dog Ear, 2011. Pp. xvi + 356. \$18.95 paper. ISBN 978-1-4575-0721-2.

Finn, Kavita Mudan. *The Last Plantagenet Consorts: Gender, Genre, and Historiography, 1440–1627.* Queenship and Power. Series eds. Carole Levin and Charles Beem. Houndmills UK and New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012. Pp. xii + 267. \$85.00. ISBN 978-0-230-39298-4.

Fitter, Chris. Radical Shakespeare: Politics and Stagecraft in the Early Career. Routledge Studies in Shakespeare 6. New York and Abingdon UK: Routledge, 2012. Pp. xii + 330. \$125.00. ISBN 978-0-415-89793-8.

Fitzpatrick, Tim. *Playwright, Space, and Place in Early Modern Performance: Shakespeare and Company.* Studies in Performance and Early Modern Drama. Gen. ed. Helen Ostovich. Farnham UK and Burlington VT: Ashgate, 2011. Pp. xiv + 314. \$124.95. ISBN 978-1-4094-2827-5.

Ford, John. *The Collected Works of John Ford.* Vol 1. Ed. Gilles Monsarrat, Brian Vickers, and R. J. C. Watt. Oxford and New York: Clarendon Press / Oxford Univ. Press, 2012. Pp. xxiv + 696. \$275.00. ISBN 978-0-19-959290-6.

Gaskill, William. *Words into Action: Finding the Life of the Play.* Foreword by Christopher Hampton. London: Nick Hern, 2010. Pp. xvi + 168. £10.99 paper. ISBN 978-1-84842-100-4.

Gilvary, Kevin, ed. Dating Shakespeare's Plays: A Critical Review of the Evidence. Tunbridge Wells UK: Parapress, 2012. Pp. xii + 508. $\pounds 15.00$ paper. ISBN 978-1-898594-86-4.

Grady, Hugh, ed. *Empson, Wilson Knight, Barber, Kott.* Great Shakespeareans 13. Gen. series eds. Peter Holland and Adrian Poole. London and New York: Continuum, 2012. Pp. xii + 218. \$140.00. ISBN 978-0-8264-4645-9.

Guenther, Genevieve. *Magical Imaginations: Instrumental Aesthetics in the English Renaissance*. Toronto, Buffalo NY, and London: Univ. of Toronto Press, 2012. Pp. xii + 169. \$65.00. ISBN 978-1-4426-4241-6.

Guneratne, Anthony R., ed. *Shakespeare and Genre: From Early Modern Inheritances to Postmodern Legacies*. Houndmills UK and New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011. Pp. xviii + 314. \$90.00. ISBN 978-0-230-10898-1.

Hillman, Richard. French Reflections in the Shakespearean Tragic: Three Case Studies. Manchester and New York: Manchester Univ. Press (distributed in the USA by Palgrave Macmillan), 2012. Pp. viii + 236. \$90.00. ISBN 978-0-7190-8717-2.

Holderness, Graham. *Nine Lives of William Shakespeare*. Shakespeare Now! Series eds. Ewan Fernie and Simon Palfrey. London and New York: Continuum, 2011. Pp. x + 215. \$27.95. ISBN 978-1-4411-5185-8.

Kastan, David Scott, and Kathryn James. *Remembering Shakespeare*. New Haven: Beinecke Rare Book and Manuscript Library (distributed by Yale Univ. Press), 2012. Pp. 78. \$25.00 paper. ISBN 978-0-300-18039-8.

Landreth, David. *The Face of Mammon: The Matter of Money in English Renaissance Literature*. Oxford and New York: Oxford Univ. Press, 2012. Pp. xii + 348. \$49.95. ISBN 978-0-19-977329-9.

Landrigan, Stephen, and Qais Akbar Omar. *Shakespeare in Kabul.* London: Haus Publishing, 2012. Pp. x + 230. £12.99. ISBN 978-1-908323-08-8.

Lawrence, Sean. Forgiving the Gift: The Philosophy of Generosity in Shakespeare and Marlowe. Medieval and Renaissance Literary Studies. Gen. ed. Rebecca Totaro. Pittsburgh PA: Duquesne Univ. Press, 2012. Pp. xxiv + 244. \$58.00. ISBN 978-0-8207-0448-7.

Litvin, Margaret. *Hamlet's Arab Journey: Shakespeare's Prince and Nasser's Ghost.* Translation/Transnation. Series ed. Emily Apter. Princeton and Oxford: Princeton Univ. Press, 2011. Pp. xx + 269. \$35.00. ISBN 978-0-691-13780-3.

López-Peláez, Jesús, ed. *Strangers in Early Modern English Texts*. Anglo-American Studies 41. Ed. Rüdiger Ahrens and Kevin Cope. Frankfurt am Main: Peter Lang, 2011. Pp. 276. \$73.95. ISBN 978-3-631-60140-2.

Lucking, David. *Making Sense in Shakespeare*. Costerus New Series 193. Amsterdam and New York: Rodopi, 2012. Pp. xiv + 233. \$70.00. ISBN 978-90-420-3502-7.

Makaryk, Irena R., and Marissa McHugh, eds. *Shakespeare and the Second World War: Memory, Culture, Identity*. Toronto, Buffalo NY, and London: Univ. of Toronto Press, 2012. Pp. xii + 338. \$65.00. ISBN 978-1-4426-4402-1.

Malim, Richard. *The Earl of Oxford and the Making of "Shake-speare": The Literary Life of Edward de Vere in Context.* Jefferson NC and London: McFarland, 2012. Pp. x + 312. \$45.00 paper. ISBN 978-0-7864-6313-8.

Mann, Jenny C. *Outlaw Rhetoric: Figuring Vernacular Eloquence in Shakespeare's England.* Ithaca NY and London: Cornell Univ. Press, 2012. Pp. xiv + 249. \$45.00. ISBN 978-0-8014-4965-9.

Marlowe, Christopher. *The Jew of Malta*. Ed. Mathew R. Martin. Broadview Editions. Series ed. L. W. Conolly. Peterborough ON and Buffalo NY: Broadview Press, 2012. Pp. 289. \$18.95 paper. ISBN 978-1-55481-068-0.

McKenzie, William, and Theodora Papadopoulou, eds. *Shakespeare and I.* Shakespeare Now! Series eds. Ewan Fernie and Simon Palfrey. London and New York: Continuum, 2012. Pp. xvi + 286. \$120.00 cloth. ISBN 978-1-4411-4371-6. \$34.95 paper. ISBN 978-1-4411-3718-0.

McMahon, Chris. Family and the State in Early Modern Revenge Drama: Economies of Vengeance. Routledge Studies in Renaissance Literature and Culture 19. New York and Abingdon UK: Routledge, 2012. Pp. 250. \$125.00. ISBN 978-0-415-80775-3.

Minear, Erin. Reverberating Song in Shakespeare and Milton: Language, Memory, and Musical Representation. Farnham UK and Burlington VT: Ashgate, 2011. Pp. viii + 287. \$104.95. ISBN 978-1-4094-3545-7.

Montgomery, Marianne. *Europe's Languages on England's Stages*, 1590–1620. Studies in Performance and Early Modern Drama. Gen. ed. Helen Ostovich. Farnham UK and Burlington VT: Ashgate, 2012. Pp. xii + 150. \$89.95. ISBN 978-1-4094-2287-7.

O'Rourke, James. *Retheorizing Shakespeare through Presentist Readings*. Routledge Studies in Shakespeare 7. New York and

Abingdon UK: Routledge, 2012. Pp. xii + 189. \$125.00. ISBN 978-0-415-89703-7.

Pennington, Michael. Sweet William: Twenty Thousand Hours with Shakespeare. London: Nick Hern, 2012. Pp. xii + 322. £20.00. ISBN 978-1-85459-568-3.

Pincombe, Mike, and Cathy Shrank, eds. *The Oxford Handbook of Tudor Literature*. Oxford and New York: Oxford Univ. Press, 2011 (paper only). Pp. xxviii + 832. \$55.00. ISBN 978-0-19-969789-2.

Pointon, A. J. *The Man Who Was Never Shakespeare: The Theft of William Shakspere's Identity.* Tunbridge Wells UK: Parapress, 2011. Pp. x + 294. £12.00 paper. ISBN 978-1-898594-88-8.

Poole, Adrian, ed. *Joyce, T. S. Eliot, Auden, Beckett.* Great Shakespeareans 12. Gen. series eds. Peter Holland and Adrian Poole. London and New York: Continuum, 2012. Pp. xvi + 226. \$140.00. ISBN 978-1-4411-8743-7.

Potter, Lois. *The Life of William Shakespeare: A Critical Biography*. Blackwell Critical Biographies. Gen. ed. Claude Rawson. Malden MA, Oxford, and Chichester UK: Wiley-Blackwell, 2012. Pp. xii + 497. \$99.95 cloth. ISBN 978-0-631-20784-9. \$34.95 paper. ISBN 978-1-118-28152-9.

Prendergast, Maria Teresa Micaela. *Railing, Reviling, and Invective in English Literary Culture, 1588–1617: The Anti-Poetics of Theater and Print.* Material Readings in Early Modern Culture. Series eds. James Daybell and Adam Smyth. Farnham UK and Burlington VT: Ashgate, 2012. Pp. xii + 246. \$99.95. ISBN 978-1-4094-3809-0.

Prentki, Tim. *The Fool in European Theatre: Stages of Folly.* Houndmills UK and New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012. Pp. viii + 229. \$85.00. ISBN 978-0-230-29159-1.

Quarmby, Kevin A. *The Disguised Ruler in Shakespeare and His Contemporaries*. Studies in Performance and Early Modern Drama. Gen. ed. Helen Ostovich. Farnham UK and Burlington VT: Ashgate, 2012. Pp. xvi + 263. \$99.95. ISBN 978-1-4094-0159-9.

Rivlin, Elizabeth. *The Aesthetics of Service in Early Modern England*. Evanston IL: Northwestern Univ. Press, 2012. Pp. viii + 218. \$69.95. ISBN 978-0-8101-2781-4.

Roston, Murray. *The Comic Mode in English Literature: From the Middle Ages to Today.* London and New York: Continuum, 2011. Pp. viii + 278. \$110.00 cloth. ISBN 978-1-4411-9588-3. \$32.95 paper. ISBN 978-1-4411-1231-6.

Rutter, Tom. *The Cambridge Introduction to Christopher Marlowe*. Cambridge Introductions to Authors. Cambridge and New York: Cambridge Univ. Press, 2012. Pp. xiv + 149. \$75.00 cloth. ISBN 978-0-521-19634-5. \$19.99 paper. ISBN 978-0-521-12430-0.

Salkeld, Duncan. *Shakespeare among the Courtesans: Prostitution, Literature, and Drama, 1500–1650.* Anglo-Italian Renaissance Studies. Series. eds. Michele Marrapodi, Keir Elam, and Robert Henke. Farnham UK and Burlington VT: Ashgate, 2012. Pp xiv + 206. \$99.95. ISBN 978-0-7546-6387-4.

Sedgwick, Fred. *Resources for Teaching Shakespeare: 11–16.* London and New York: Continuum, 2011. Pp. xii + 116. \$55.00 paper. ISBN 978-0-8264-38591.

Shakespeare Studies 49 (2011). Gen. eds. Mariko Ichikawa, Takayuki Katsuyama, and Shoichiro Kawai. Tokyo: Shakespeare Society of Japan, 2011. ¥2,000.00 annually individuals. ¥5,000.00 annually institutions. ISSN 0582-9402.

Shakespeare, William. *Romeo and Juliet*. Ed. René Weis. Arden Shakespeare. Third Series. Gen. eds. Richard Proudfoot, Ann Thompson, David Scott Kastan, and H. R. Woudhuysen. London: Arden/Methuen Drama, 2012. Pp. xviii + 451. \$100.00. ISBN 978-1-9034-3690-5.

Shakespeare, William. *The Tragedie of Macbeth: A Frankly Annotated First Folio Edition*. Annotated and with an introduction by Demitra Papadinis. Jefferson NC and London: McFarland, 2012. Pp. viii + 426. \$35.00 paper. ISBN 978-0-7864-6479-1.

Shakespeare, William. *The Two Noble Kinsmen*. Ed. Robert Kean Turner and Patricia Tatspaugh. The New Cambridge Shakespeare. Gen. ed. Brian Gibbons. Cambridge and New York: Cambridge Univ. Press, 2012. Pp. xvi + 229. \$16.99 paper. ISBN 978-0-521-68699-0.

Shakespeare's Original Pronunciation: Speeches and Scenes Performed as Shakespeare Would Have Heard Them. London: British Library (distributed by Univ. of Chicago Press), 2012. Audio recording, 1 compact disc; 75 min. \$15.00. ISBN 978-0-7123-5119-5.

Shakespearean International Yearbook 11: Graham Bradshaw, Tom Bishop, and Alexander C. Y. Huang, eds. for Special Issue, Placing Michael Neill; Issues of Place in Shakespeare and Early Modern Culture. Guest ed. Jonathan Gil Harris. Farnham UK and Burlington VT: Ashgate, 2011. Pp. x + 285. \$114.95. ISBN 978-1-4094-3229-6.

Sillars, Stuart. *Shakespeare, Time, and the Victorians: A Pictorial Exploration*. Cambridge and New York: Cambridge Univ. Press, 2012. Pp. xxiv + 360. \$99.00. ISBN 978-0-521-50969-5.

Smith, Peter J. Between Two Stools: Scatology and Its Representations in English Literature, Chaucer to Swift. Manchester UK and New York: Manchester Univ. Press (distributed in the USA exclusively by Palgrave Macmillan), 2012. Pp. xii + 292. \$100.00. ISBN 978-0-7190-8794-3.

Strier, Richard. *The Unrepentant Renaissance: From Petrarch to Shakespeare to Milton.* Chicago and London: Univ. of Chicago Press, 2011. Pp. xii + 304. \$45.00. ISBN 978-0-226-77751-1.

Syme, Holger Schott. *Theatre and Testimony in Shakespeare's England: A Culture of Mediation*. Cambridge and New York: Cambridge Univ. Press, 2012. Pp. xiv + 283. \$95.00. ISBN 978-1-107-01185-4.

Taylor, Gary, and Trish Thomas Henley, eds. *The Oxford Handbook of Thomas Middleton*. Oxford and New York: Oxford Univ. Press, 2012. Pp. xviii + 670. \$150.00. ISBN 978-0-19-955988-6.

Tigner, Amy L. Literature and the Renaissance Garden from Elizabeth I to Charles II: England's Paradise. Literary and Scientific Cultures of Early Modernity. Series eds. Mary Thomas Crane and Henry Turner. Farnham UK and Burlington VT: Ashgate, 2012. Pp. xii + 271. \$104.95. ISBN 978-1-4094-3674-4.

Vaughan, Alden T., and Virginia Mason Vaughan. *Shakespeare in America*. Oxford Shakespeare Topics. Oxford and New York: Oxford Univ. Press, 2012. Pp. xiv + 220. \$27.95 paper. ISBN 978-0-19-956637-2.

Vaught, Jennifer C. *Carnival and Literature in Early Modern England.* Farnham UK and Burlington VT: Ashgate, 2012. Pp. xii + 195. S99.95. ISBN 978-1-4094-3208-1.

Waller, Gary. *The Virgin Mary in Late Medieval and Early Modern English Literature and Popular Culture*. Cambridge and New York: Cambridge Univ. Press, 2011. Pp. xii + 237. \$90.00 cloth. ISBN

978-0-521-76296-0. \$36.00 paper. ISBN 978-1-107-40766-4.

Wells, Stanley. *Shakespeare, Sex, and Love.* Oxford and New York: Oxford Univ. Press, 2010. Pp. xii + 282. \$17.95 paper only. ISBN 978-0-19-957859-7.

Wiegandt, Kai. *Crowd and Rumour in Shakespeare*. Studies in Performance and Early Modern Drama. Gen. ed. Helen Ostovich. Farnham UK and Burlington VT: Ashgate, 2012. Pp. xii + 215. \$99.95. ISBN 978-1-4094-3219-7.

Wiggins, Martin, and Catherine Richardson, eds. *British Drama* 1533–1642: A Catalogue. Vol. 1: 1533–1566. Oxford and New York: Oxford Univ. Press, 2012. Pp. lii + 500. \$160.00. ISBN 978-0-19-926571-8.